

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	vii
FOREWORD	xi
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xiii
ABBREVIATIONS	xv
GENERAL INTRODUCTION.....	1
CHAPTER 1	
THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	9
1. Introduction	9
2. Concepts and Definitions	9
2.1. Minorities.....	9
2.1.1. Working Definition	9
2.1.2. Elements of the Working Definition	11
2.1.2.1. Ethnic, Religious or Linguistic Characteristics.	11
2.1.2.2. The Numerical Criterion.....	15
2.1.2.3. Citizenship and Durable Ties with the Territory.....	17
2.1.2.4. Non-Dominant or Co-Dominant Position	24
2.1.2.5. The Subjective Component.....	27
2.2. Effective Participation in Public Affairs	28
2.2.1. Participation and Representation	28
2.2.2. Public Affairs.....	31
2.2.3. 'Effective' Participation in Public Affairs	33
3. Justification and Problematic Aspects of Minority Participation and Representation	33
3.1. Justification of Minority Rights	34
3.1.1. Minority Rights and Political Philosophy	34
3.1.2. The Legal Perspective.....	44
3.2. Justification of Minority Participation and Representation	48
3.2.1. Substantive Equality (Legal Rights-Track).....	48
3.2.1.1. Introduction	48
3.2.1.2. Integration and Inclusion (Reversing Discrimination)	55

3.2.1.3.	Preservation and Promotion of Identity (Reversing Assimilation)	65
3.2.2.	Peace and Stability (Security-Track)	71
3.3.	Problematic Aspects of Minority Participation and Representation	74
3.3.1.	Mirror Representation, Authorisation, and Accountability	74
3.3.2.	Essentialism – Multiple Identities – Opting-Out Principle	81
3.3.3.	Presence/Influence Distinction – Deliberative Democracy	84
3.3.4.	Group Proliferation and Social Cohesion at Risk	88
3.4.	Conclusion	91

CHAPTER 2

PROTECTION OF MINORITY PARTICIPATORY RIGHTS THROUGH GENERAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS OF INTERNATIONAL LAW 95

1.	Introduction	95
2.	The Right to Freedom of Expression	104
2.1.	Article 19 ICCPR	104
2.2.	Article 10 ECHR	105
3.	The Right to Freedom of Assembly and Freedom of Association	107
3.1.	Articles 21 and 22 ICCPR	107
3.2.	Article 11 ECHR	108
3.2.1.	<i>Lex Specialis</i> of Freedom of Expression	108
3.2.2.	Permissible Restrictions	109
3.2.3.	The Cases on Dissolution of Turkish Parties	111
3.2.4.	A Special Case? The <i>Refah Partisi</i> Judgment	114
3.2.5.	Cases against Greece regarding the Macedonian Minority and the Muslim Minority in Western Thrace	115
3.2.6.	Cases against Bulgaria regarding the Macedonian Minority	117
3.2.7.	<i>Gorzelik v. Poland</i> : No Unilateral Claiming of Electoral Minority Privileges	120
3.2.8.	Registration, Self-Regulation and Autonomy of Religious Associations	126
4.	The Right to Vote and to Stand for Election	127
4.1.	Article 25 ICCPR	127
4.1.1.	Participation in the Conduct of Public Affairs	128

4.1.2.	Right to Vote and to Be Elected	130
4.1.3.	Equal Access to Public Service	132
4.1.4.	Restriction to Citizens	133
4.1.5.	Non-Discrimination	133
4.1.6.	Article 25 Containing Individual Rights	135
4.2.	Article 3 Protocol No. 1 ECHR	136
4.2.1.	Introduction	136
4.2.1.1.	Material Scope	136
4.2.1.2.	The Concept of “Legislature”	137
4.2.1.3.	Permitted Restrictions	138
4.2.2.	Electoral Systems: A Broad Margin of Appreciation	140
4.2.2.1.	Proportional Representation	141
4.2.2.2.	Residence Requirements	142
4.2.2.3.	Electoral Thresholds	144
4.2.2.4.	Oaths	148
4.2.3.	No Linguistic Component in Article 3 Protocol No. 1.	149
4.2.3.1.	<i>Mathieu-Mohin & Clerfayt v. Belgium</i>	149
4.2.3.2.	<i>Podkolzina v. Latvia</i>	151
5.	The Right to Equality and Non-Discrimination	152
5.1.	Articles 2 and 26 ICCPR	154
5.2.	Article 14 ECHR and Protocol No. 12 ECHR	158
5.2.1.	Article 14 ECHR	158
5.2.2.	Protocol No. 12 ECHR	163
6.	Article 27 ICCPR – The Minority Provision	165
7.	Article 1 ICCPR – The Right to (Internal) Self-Determination	175
8.	The ICCPR and the ECHR Compared: Conclusion	192

CHAPTER 3

THE INTERNATIONAL RIGHT OF MINORITIES TO EFFECTIVE PARTICIPATION IN PUBLIC AFFAIRS 199

1.	Introduction	199
2.	Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe	201
2.1.	Concluding Document of the Copenhagen Meeting of the Conference on the Human Dimension (1990)	202
2.2.	The High Commissioner on National Minorities	207
2.2.1.	Introduction: The HCNM and Other OSCE Institutions	207
2.2.2.	Mandate of the HCNM	209
2.2.3.	Working Instruments of the HCNM	211

2.2.4.	The Lund Recommendations on Effective Participation of National Minorities in Public Life (1999)	213
2.2.4.1.	Background, Origin and Status of the Lund Recommendations	213
2.2.4.2.	Structure and Content of the Lund Recommendations	216
2.2.4.3.	Application of the Lund Recommendations ..	226
2.2.5.	Warsaw Guidelines to Assist National Minority Participation in the Electoral Process (2001)	228
2.2.6.	Recommendations on Policing in Multi-Ethnic Societies (2006)	229
2.2.7.	Effective Participation of Minorities in Public Life and the Work of the HCNM.	230
2.3.	Conclusion	245
3.	United Nations	247
3.1.	Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities (1992)	248
3.2.	The former UN Working Group on Minorities, the UN Forum on Minority Issues and the UN Independent Expert on Minority Issues	257
3.2.1.	The Former UN Working Group on Minorities and the UN Forum on Minority Issues	257
3.2.1.1.	Establishment, Mandate and Functioning of the Former UN Working Group on Minority Issues	257
3.2.1.2.	Effective Participation of Minorities in Public Life and the Work of the UN Working Group on Minorities	261
3.2.1.3.	The UN Forum on Minority Issues	264
3.2.2.	The UN Independent Expert on Minority Issues	265
3.3.	Conclusion	269
4.	Council of Europe	271
4.1.	The Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (1995) and Its Monitoring Mechanism	273
4.1.1.	Introduction	273
4.1.1.1.	Drafting History, Object, Purpose and Legal Nature	273
4.1.1.2.	Monitoring Mechanism	276
4.1.2.	The Right to Effective Participation in Public Affairs in the Monitoring of the ACFC	284
4.1.2.1.	Introduction	284

4.1.2.2.	Articles 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 16 FCNM.....	285
	A. Equality Principle (Article 4)	286
	B. Citizenship Legislation (Articles 3, 4 and 6)	290
	C. Cultural Autonomy (Article 5)	290
	D. Recruitment in Law Enforcement Institutions (Article 6).....	292
	E. Freedom of Assembly and of Association (Article 7)	293
	F. Altering Municipal and Other Boundaries (Article 16).....	295
4.1.2.3.	Article 15 FCNM	296
	A. Territorial and Personal Autonomy and Self-Government Arrangements	300
	B. Participation in Legislative Decision- Making Processes at National, Regional and Local level	306
	1. A Broad Margin of Appreciation.	306
	2. Good Practices	306
	3. Implicit Stand-Still Clause	309
	4. Expansive Approach	311
	5. Mirror Representation – Accountability	313
	6. Internal Diversity – “The Trap of Essentialism”	314
	7. The Presence/Influence Distinction ...	315
	8. Social Cohesion	317
	C. Participation in the Executive and the Judiciary.....	318
	1. Participation in Government at National, Regional and Local Level ...	318
	2. Civil Servant Jobs, Jobs in Law Enforcement Institutions and Participation in the Judiciary.....	318
	3. Specialized Governmental Bodies.	321
	D. Advisory and Consultative Bodies	324
4.1.3.	The ACFC Commentary on the Effective Participation of Persons Belonging to National Minorities in Cultural, Social and Economic Life and in Public Affairs.....	327
4.1.4.	Conclusion.....	330

4.2.	Other Council of Europe Bodies and Institutions Dealing and Heaving Dealt with Effective Participation of Minorities in Public Affairs	333
4.2.1.	Brief Overview	334
4.2.2.	The European Commission for Democracy through Law (The Venice Commission).....	339
4.2.3.	The Committee of Experts on Issues Relating to the Protection of National Minorities (DH-MIN).....	348
5.	Bilateral Treaties.....	354
6.	Conclusion.....	366

CHAPTER 4

DOMESTIC MECHANISMS IMPLEMENTING THE RIGHT TO EFFECTIVE PARTICIPATION OF MINORITIES IN PUBLIC

AFFAIRS IN A COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

1.	Introduction	375
2.	Elected Bodies: Decision-Making Processes on National, Regional and Municipal Level	382
2.1.	Election Procedures – “Presence”	382
2.1.1.	Citizenship, Freedom of Association and the Right to Vote and to Stand for Election as Preconditions.	383
2.1.2.	Electoral Systems: Overview.....	390
2.1.3.	Integration of Minority Representatives in the Mainstream Party System.....	397
2.1.4.	Electoral ‘Privileges’ for Minority Parties and Minority Representatives	400
2.1.4.1.	Reduced Requirements for Registration.	401
2.1.4.2.	Privileged Funding of Minority Parties	402
2.1.4.3.	Favourable Delimitation of Constituencies ...	403
2.1.4.4.	Lowered Threshold.....	407
2.1.4.5.	Reserved Seats.....	412
2.2.	Position and Rights of Minority Representatives and Minority Parties in Legislative Bodies: “Influence”.....	429
2.2.1.	Group Status	430
2.2.2.	Special Voting Rights, in Particular, the Veto Right on Minority Issues	430
2.2.3.	Deliberative Democracy	435
2.3.	Parliamentary Committees for Minority Issues	437
2.4.	Bodies Appointed by Parliament for Examining Complaints or Conducting Inquiries: Ombudspersons.....	439

3.	Participation in the Executive and Judiciary.....	441
3.1.	Specialised Governmental Bodies.....	442
3.1.1.	Ministerial Responsibilities for Minority Issues.....	442
3.1.2.	Government Commissioner for Minorities.....	444
3.2.	Guaranteed Representation in the Executive (Government) and the Judiciary (Highest Courts).....	445
3.3.	Access to Public Service.....	447
4.	Round Tables, Advisory and Consultative Bodies, Liaison Committees .	453
5.	The Role of Associations and NGOs.....	459
6.	Federalism, Territorial and Non-Territorial Autonomy and Self- Government Arrangements.....	461
6.1.	Federalism.....	466
6.2.	Territorial Autonomy.....	468
6.3.	Non-Territorial Forms of Autonomy.....	472
6.4.	Local or Municipal Autonomy.....	480
7.	Power-Sharing and Consociationalism.....	481
7.1.	Power-Sharing and the Integrative Approach.....	482
7.2.	Consociationalism.....	484
7.2.1.	Characteristics.....	484
7.2.2.	Problematic Aspects.....	489
7.2.3.	Changing Consociational Arrangements.....	492
8.	Conclusion.....	500

CHAPTER 5

THREE CASE STUDIES: BELGIUM, ITALY AND HUNGARY..... 507

1.	Justification of Choice of States.....	507
2.	Belgium.....	509
2.1.	Introduction: From a Unitary to a Federal State.....	510
2.1.1.	A Bipolar and Centrifugal Federalism.....	510
2.1.2.	Territoriality Principle.....	515
2.2.	Minorities in Belgium.....	524
2.2.1.	Linguistic Minorities.....	525
2.2.2.	Other Minorities.....	533
2.3.	Electoral System.....	537
2.3.1.	Proportional Representation.....	537
2.3.2.	The Bilingual Electoral District Brussels-Hal- Vilvorde.....	538
2.3.3.	Guaranteed Representation.....	541
2.4.	Power-Sharing at the Federal Level.....	542
2.4.1.	Parliament.....	544

2.4.2.	The Executive	546
2.4.3.	Access to Public Service and Representation in the Judiciary.....	547
2.5.	Linguistic Minority Representation at the Regional Level	548
2.5.1.	The Community and Regional Elections	549
2.5.2.	Brussels: An Example of Regional Consociationalism..	555
2.5.2.1.	Brussels-Capital Regional Parliament	555
2.5.2.2.	Brussels-Capital Regional Government	561
2.5.2.3.	Quotas in the Regional Administration.....	562
2.5.2.4.	Brussels' 19 Municipalities.....	563
2.5.2.5.	Brussels' Community Commissions.....	565
2.6.	Effective Participation of Other Minorities	567
2.6.1.	Ideological and Philosophical Minorities.....	567
2.6.2.	Ethnic and Religious Minorities	570
2.7.	Concluding Remarks	575
3.	Italy.....	577
3.1.	Introduction	577
3.2.	Effective Participation at the National Level	581
3.2.1.	Party Financing	581
3.2.2.	Electoral Districts.....	581
3.2.3.	Electoral System	581
3.2.4.	Guaranteed Representation in the European Parliament	585
3.3.	Italy: Asymmetric, "Quasi-Federal" Regionalism.....	585
3.4.	Special Autonomous Region Trentino – Alto Adige: A Case in Itself	591
3.4.1.	Background Information	591
3.4.2.	Relationship between the Regional and National Level..	594
3.4.3.	Declaration of Affiliation – The Principle of Ethnic Proportional Representation	595
3.4.4.	Residence Requirement for Voting Rights	597
3.4.5.	Guaranteed Representation of the Ladin-speaking population	599
3.4.6.	Power-Sharing at the Regional and Provincial Levels ..	604
3.4.7.	Access to Public and Private Office – Representation in the Judiciary	610
3.5.	Concluding Remarks	612
4.	Hungary.....	614
4.1.	Introduction	614
4.2.	Personal Autonomy: The Local, Regional and National Minority Self-Governments	620

4.2.1.	Tasks and Competences	622
4.2.2.	Election of the Minority Self-Governments.....	623
4.2.3.	Problems with the System of Minority Self- Governments.....	626
4.2.3.1.	Tasks and Competences of the MSGs.....	627
4.2.3.2.	Voters and Candidates for Election of Local MSGs	629
4.2.3.3.	National MSGs: From Winner-takes-all Electoral System to Proportional Representation	638
4.2.3.4.	Other Problems.....	639
4.3.	Participation in Elected Bodies at the Local and National Level .	641
4.3.1.	Guaranteed Representation in Parliament.....	641
4.3.2.	Guaranteed Representation in Local Councils	648
4.4.	The Executive.....	650
4.4.1.	Ministerial Responsibilities for Minority Issues.....	650
4.4.2.	Ombudsman for National and Ethnic Minority Rights.	652
4.5.	MSGs as Advisory and Consultative Bodies	653
4.6.	Concluding Remarks	653
GENERAL CONCLUSION		655
BIBLIOGRAPHY		673
CASE LAW.....		703
INDEX.....		715