



*Human Rights* presents human rights in action, focusing on their effectiveness as legal tools designed to benefit human beings. By combining conceptual analysis with an emphasis on procedures and mechanisms of implementation, this volume provides a multidimensional overview of human rights.

After examining briefly the history of human rights, the author analyses the intellectual framework that forms the basis of their legitimacy. In particular, he covers the concept of universality and the widely used model that classifies human rights into clusters of different 'generations'.

The volume then moves on to analyse the activities of the political institutions of the United Nations, the expert bodies established by the relevant treaties, and the international tribunals specifically entrusted at the regional level with protecting human rights. The author explains how and why in recent years, the classical array of politically inspired informal devices

has been enriched by the addition of international criminal procedures and by endeavours to introduce civil suits against alleged individual violators of human rights. Finally, the volume is rounded off by a consideration of the importance of humanitarian law as an instrument for the protection of human life and dignity.

## Human Rights

Between Idealism and Realism

Christian Tomuschat

### Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiv
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxi
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xliv
<b>1. Introduction</b>	1
<b>2. History of Human Rights</b>	6
I Human Rights and the Rise of the State in Europe	6
II International Protection of Human Rights: a Latecomer in History	7
III From the Sixteenth Century to 1776	9
Protection of Human Beings by Denial of Human Rights	9
Protection of Human Beings by Grant of Human Rights	11
IV From 1776 to 1914	12
Human Rights in National Constitutional Texts	12
Abolition of the Slave Trade	13
Humanitarian Law	14
No General Guarantees of Human Rights	15
V Between the Two World Wars	16
Mandate System of the League of Nations	16
International Protection of Minorities	17
Objectives of the International Labour Organization	20
Legal Doctrine	20
VI The Great Leap Forward: 1945	22

<b>3. The Different ‘Generations’ of Human Rights: From Human Rights to Good Governance</b>	24
I Terminology	24
II Development of First Generation and Second Generation Rights at National Level	25
First Generation Rights	26
Second Generation Rights	27
III Development of the Current System of International Protection of Human Rights	28
Universal Declaration of Human Rights	29
European Convention of Human Rights and the European Social Charter	30
The Two UN Covenants on Human Rights	31
American Convention on Human Rights	33
African Charter of Human and Peoples’ Rights	33
No Regional Instrument in Asia	33
Customary Law	34
Soft Law	36
IV Contents of the International Bill of Human Rights	37
Substantive Provisions	37
Rights and Obligations Under Human Rights Treaties	37
Equality and Non-discrimination	41
Background	41
Legal Instruments Banning Discrimination	43
The Unity, and the Difference in Character, of First Generation and Second Generation Rights	46
V Third Generation Rights	48
The Three Rights	48
Right to Development	48
Right to Peace	49
Right to a Clean Environment	49
Uncertainties Surrounding Third Generation Rights	50
Holders of the Rights	50
Duty Bearers	51
Contents	51
VI Democracy	52
VII Good Governance	54
VIII Human Security	55
IX Conclusion	57
<b>4. Universality of Human Rights</b>	58
I Introductory Considerations	58
II The Legal Dimension	63
UDHR	63
The Two International Covenants	64
Other Treaties	65
Vienna World Conference on Human Rights	67
Regional Instruments	68
III The Value Dimension	69
Western Values	70
Latin America	72
Islamic Countries	73
East Asia	75
IV The Empirical Dimension	78
V Conclusion	81
<b>5. Implementation at National Level</b>	84
I Duty Bearers	84
States	84
International Organizations	85
European Communities	85
United Nations	86

World Trade Organization	90
Transnational Corporations	90
II Relationship Between International Law and Domestic Law in the Field of Human Rights	91
Third Generation Rights	91
Second Generation Rights	92
First Generation Rights	92
European Convention on Human Rights	94
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	96
III Place of Human Rights Instruments in the Domestic Legal Order	101
IV Implementation of International Human Rights vis-à-vis the Individual	104
V Territorial Scope of Application of International Human Rights Instruments	106
European Convention on Human Rights	106
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	109
<b>6. The Work of Political Bodies of International Organizations</b>	112
I United Nations	112
Norm-setting	113
Monitoring	114
The General Assembly and the HRCion	115
The Security Council	128
II European Union	132
III Conclusion	135
<b>7. The Work of Expert Bodies: Examination of State Reports</b>	136
I Introductory Considerations	136
II Reporting Systems at Regional Level	138
European Convention on Human Rights	138
African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	139
III Reporting Systems at UN Level	140
Monitoring Bodies	140
Examining State Reports in Practice	142
The Early Stages	142
Later Developments: The Current Situation	148
Contribution on NGOs	150
Delayed Reports	152
Consequences	154
Follow-up	154
Effects of Concluding Observations	154
General Comments and General Recommendations	156
<b>8. The Work of Expert Bodies: Complaint Procedures and Fact-finding</b>	159
I Complaint Procedures	159
Stocktaking	159
Universal Level	159
Interstate Complaint Procedures	159
Individual Communication Procedures	160
Regional Level	165
Interstate Complaint Procedures	165
Individual Complaint Procedures	165
Reservations	169
General Features of Individual Communication Procedures	170
Persons Entitled to File Communications	170
Rights that Can Be Asserted	173
Standing	174
Exhaustion of Local Remedies	175
Other International Procedures of Settlement	176
Unsubstantiated Communications	177
Absence of Oral Hearings	179
Interim Relief	180

Outcome	182
Non-binding Views	182
Follow-up	183
Publication of the Case Law	184
Quantitative Assessment	185
Qualitative Assessment	186
II Fact-finding	186
General Considerations	186
Existing Procedures	187
Fact-finding by the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights	187
Fact-finding by the Committee Against Torture	187
Fact-finding by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture	188
New Optional Protocol to the UN Convention Against Torture	189
III Conclusion	190
<b>9. Supervision by International Tribunals</b>	191
I Introductory Considerations	191
II The Worldwide Level	191
Advisory Opinions of the ICJ	192
Judgments of the ICJ in Contentious Proceedings	195
III Regional Level	198
European Court of Human Rights	198
General Features	198
Interstate Applications	200
Individual Applications	202
Enforcement of Judgments	208
Inter-American Court of Human Rights	211
General Features	211
Quantitative Balance Sheet	212
Interim Relief	213
Consequences Attaching to the Finding of a Violation	213
African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights	214
Court of Justice of the European Communities	215
<b>10. Enforcement by States and the Role of Non-Governmental Organizations</b>	216
I General Considerations	216
II Action by States	217
Diplomatic Protection	218
Representations by Diplomatic Means	218
Interstate Complaints	218
Measures of Retortion	219
Countermeasures	220
Treaty Clauses on Observance of Human Rights	225
Military Intervention	226
Human Rights Enforcement in Practice	229
III Action by Non-Governmental Organizations	231
Definition of NGOs	231
Legitimacy of NGOs	232
Activities of NGOs	233
The Domestic Field of Action	233
The International Field of Action	235
<b>11. Mitigating the Effects of Armed Conflict: Humanitarian Law</b>	241
I General Considerations	241
<i>Jus ad Bellum, Jus in Bello</i>	241
Non-discrimination	242
II Brief Historical Survey	244
Before the First World War	244
Between the Two World Wars	246
After the Second World War	247

III Prohibition of Specific Weapons	247
IV Law Making	248
Necessity of Humanitarian Law?	248
Legal Sources	249
Treaties	249
Custom	249
V Main Issues	251
War and Armed Conflict	251
Internal Armed conflict	251
Distinction Between Combatants and Civilians	255
Distinction Between Military and Civilian Targets	256
Protection of the Environment, Protection of Human Habitat	258
Threshold of Armed Conflict	258
Applicability of Common Article 3	259
Declaration on Minimum Humanitarian Standards	260
Lacunae in the Legal Regime of Internal Armed Conflict	260
VI Ensuring Observance of, and Respect for, Humanitarian Law	262
A Culture of Compliance	262
Monitoring	262
Countermeasures	264
State Responsibility	265
<b>12. Criminal Prosecution of Human Rights Violations</b>	267
I General Considerations	267
II National Prosecution	270
Territorial Jurisdiction	270
Extraterritorial Jurisdiction	273
III International Prosecution	280
International Military Tribunal at Nürnberg	281
Ad hoc Tribunals Established by the Security Council	282
International Criminal Court	283
Hybrid Criminal Tribunals	285
IV A Summary Balance Sheet of the Two Ad Hoc Tribunals	286
Authority of the Security Council	286
Customary Nature of International Criminal Law	287
Non-international Armed Conflicts	287
Amnesties	288
Pre-trial Detention	289
Reparation for Persons Erroneously Prosecuted	289
Statistics	290
V Conclusions	291
<b>13. Civil Suits Against Human Rights Violators</b>	293
I General Considerations	293
II Redress Afforded by the International Community	295
III The Gaps in Existing International Systems	296
IV A Cause of Action under International Law	297
Reparation Under Human Rights Treaties	297
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	297
European Convention on Human Rights	299
American Convention on Human Rights	300
Conclusion	301
Reparation Under European Community Law	302
Reparation Under the Convention Against Torture	303
Reparation Within the Framework of Criminal Prosecution	303
V Legal Connotation of Individual Claims Under International Law	305
General Framework	305
Competent Forum	307
VI Procedures Under Domestic Law	309
VII Immunity	312

**14 Time for Hope, or Time for Despair?**

319

323

*Index*