



European
University
Institute

ROBERT
SCHUMAN
CENTRE FOR
ADVANCED
STUDIES



GLOBAL
GOVERNANCE
Programme



ITHACA - INTEGRATION, TRANSNATIONAL

MOBILITY AND HUMAN, SOCIAL

AND ECONOMIC CAPITAL TRANSFERS

Capital Transfers and Social Remittances of Transnational Migrants in the EU

ITHACA Research Report N. 6/2015

Irina Isaakyan
Global Governance Programme, RSCAS, EUI



Funded by DG Home of
the European Commission

**EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY INSTITUTE, FLORENCE
ROBERT SCHUMAN CENTRE FOR ADVANCED STUDIES**

Capital Transfers and Social Remittances of Transnational Migrants in the EU

ITHACA Research Report N.6/2015

IRINA ISAAKYAN

GLOBAL GOVERNANCE PROGRAMME, RSCAS, EUI

ITHACA PROJECT

Isaakyan

This text may be downloaded only for personal research purposes. Additional reproduction for other purposes, whether in hard copies or electronically, requires the consent of the author(s), editor(s).

If cited or quoted, reference should be made to the full name of the author(s), editor(s), the title, the working paper, or other series, the year and the publisher.

© 2015 Irina Isaakyan

Printed in Italy

European University Institute

Badia Fiesolana

I – 50014 San Domenico di Fiesole (FI)

Italy

www.eui.eu/RSCAS/Publications/

www.eui.eu

cadmus.eui.eu

The ITHACA Research Project

ITHACA - Integration, Transnational Mobility and Human, Social and Economic Capital

ITHACA studies the links between migrants' integration and their transnational engagement. Migrants engage in transnational mobility for an array of economic reasons as well as emotional or political ties with their country of origin. They develop transnational business, trade, investments, or social and cultural programmes and circulate between their two countries. ITHACA explores the interconnections between the integration process and transnational mobility of migrants and aims to answer three key questions: To what extent, and in what ways, do integration conditions in the country of destination encourage transnational mobility? What are the conditions in the country of origin that may encourage transnational mobility? What type of transfers take place through the transnational mobility of migrants? ITHACA focuses on economic integration and mobility conditions as factors that encourage or prevent transnational mobility.

The ITHACA project is hosted at the Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies and co-ordinated by Prof. Anna Triandafyllidou (anna.triandafyllidou@eui.eu). The project is funded by DG Home of the European Commission.

The EUI and the RSCAS are not responsible for the opinion expressed by the author(s)

The Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies (RSCAS), at the European University Institute (EUI), directed by Brigid Laffan from September 2013, was set up in 1992 as a complementary initiative to develop inter-disciplinary and comparative research and to promote work on the major issues facing the process of integration and European society. The Centre hosts major research programmes and projects, and a range of working groups and ad hoc initiatives. The research agenda is organised around a set of core themes and is continuously evolving, reflecting the changing agenda of European integration and the expanding membership of the European Union. One of its core themes is Migration.

Irina ISAAKYAN is a Research Associate for the ITHACA project. She has recently completed her Marie Curie Intra-EU Fellowship awarded for the project *FEMIDE /Female Migration from Developed Countries in Southern Europe*. She obtained her PhD from the University of Edinburgh and holds an MA Degree from the University of Minnesota.

For further information:

ITHACA Project

Global Governance Programme

Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies

European University Institute

Via delle Fontanelle, 18, 50016 San Domenico di Fiesole (FI), Italy

Fax: + 39 055 4685 770

E-mail: anna.triandafyllidou@eui.eu or roubini.gropas@eui.eu

<http://ITHACA.eui.eu>

Executive Summary

Looking at more than 300 narrative, in-depth interviews conducted in 2014-2015 by the ITHACA team members with Bosnian, Ukrainian, Filipino, Moroccan and Indian transnational migrants in Austria, the UK, Italy and Spain; this paper aims to explore the interaction of migrants' capital transfers with their social remittances. The basic questions that generate the study are:

- (1) To what extent - and in what ways - do transnational migrants generate social remittances?
- (2) How does it interact with their capital transfers and social repositioning in their multiples societies?

The concepts of “capital transfer”, “remittance script” and “civic participation” are among the theoretical resources to inform this study. The findings show that social remittances may depend on such factors as war trauma or local political conflict in the country of origin, diaspora dynamics in the country of destination and the migrant's professional activities. The majority of social remittances emerge as an outcome and a source of complex chains of capital transfer between the countries of origin and destination and between different forms of material and non-material capital. Social remittances themselves often turn into symbolic capital, related to migrants' new social statuses in their communities. The social remittances generated by our informants can be divided into the following three basic categories:

- *(cross)cultural social remittances*;
- social remittances related to civic participation or local community development within the framework of human ecology (*ecological remittances*); and
- ideas and practices of political activism (*political social remittances*).

These categories often overlap and point to the complexity of capital transfers made by the migrants. Amidst various forms of social remittances generated by the informants, the most frequent activities are: moral support for co-national migrants and returnees; poverty-fighting projects in the country of origin, based both on monetary donations and transnational travel; and opening a restaurant or a shop in either the country of origin or the country of destination.

As “socially remitting” transnational migrants, the informants can be grouped into several types, which illuminate interplay of gender, nationality, migration corridor and other contextual factors: (1) the Filipino/Ukrainian domestic worker who sends ecological and cultural social remittances back home; (2)

the highly skilled Indian/Moroccan migrant who makes cultural and ecological remittances both locally and globally; and (3) the Bosnian/Ukrainian migrant who is involved in political projects of reconciliation and homeland-restoration.

The study findings further show that the factors of gender and migration corridor are obviously present. However, their role in generating social remittances needs further examination.

Keywords

Integration, transnational mobility, remittances, economic investment, Europe, third country nationals

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	6
Table of Contents	8
1. Introduction	9
2. Basic Concepts and Critical Issues	11
Capital transfers.....	11
The concept of social remittances	12
Contexts of social remittances.....	13
Social remittances and integration	16
3. Social Remittances from ITHACA	17
The typology of the socially remitting migrant.....	20
Type 1: Filipino/Ukrainian domestic workers.....	21
Type 2: Highly skilled Ukrainian/Bosnian men.....	23
Type 3: High-skill migrants from India.....	23
Type 4: Highly skilled Moroccans in Italy.....	25
4. Discussion	27
Revising Conditions for Social Remittances.....	27
Scripts of professionalism	28
Traumatic scripts	29
Opening migration corridors	32
Is the place important?	33
5. Concluding remarks	34
References	37

1. Introduction

According to the Eurostat (2011) data release, there are almost 32 million third-country nationals living in the EU. In fact, international migration is rapidly increasing nowadays, and both high-skill and low-skill migrants of the 21st century move to Europe from all over the world through a variety of channels and may have diverse migration/integration trajectories. Even in the conditions of under-employment and marginalization, many of them remain highly transnational trying to transfer their professional and cultural knowledge and skills to new professional and everyday contexts, and to make a contribution to their multiple societies (Faist 2010; Glick-Schiller 2009; Vertovec 2009). The field of transnationalism studies has recently been marked by increased attention to *the topic of migrants' remittances - or contributions they make to their home and host societies through a variety of formal and informal routes, both in the economic and non-monetary form, and not necessarily through frequent physical travelling* (Bermudez-Torres 2006; Faist 2010; Glick-Schiller 2008; Tilly 2007).

The concept of “remittance” generally applies to any outcome of migration that can make an impact wider than on the level of the immediate family. It is associated with a monetary or non-monetary product. Remittances are primarily associated with economic contributions of migrants to their country of origin. An example of economic remittance is the money donated by a UK-based Asian migrant to open a new shop or restaurant back home in Asia (through his home-based relatives or friends) to facilitate consumption of UK products in his hometown (Bagwell 2014; Carling 2014). However, the concept has been recently expanded to cover also non-economic products created by migrants (often through a chain of various cultural and economic capital transfers) such as new values, ideas and practices. If such an enterprise set back home is an entirely new practice for the country of origin, it may be also considered a social remittance (regardless of how consciously it is generated).

Scholars of transnationalism studies often refer to “remittances” as “capital transfers” whereas these two terms do not mean the same. If we look at Bourdieu’s (1977, 1984, 1985, 1990, 1993, 1994, 1997, 2000, 2006) works over a number of years, a capital transfer is related to the migrant’s ability to learn and to apply prior knowledge to a new context after some modification.¹ A remittance ‘always encompasses a two-sided agency – the provider [the migrant] and the receiver [the society]’ (Carling 2014: 228). In some cases, a capital transfer may indeed immediately turn into a socio-economic remittance - when, for example, the migrant transfers money or sends a designed plan for establishing a hospital for poor children in the country of origin. However, there are many examples of (monetary) transfers that get stuck in the

¹ See also Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992).

bureaucratic machine of the country of origin or lead to short-lived and unsuccessful hometown projects, which do not eventually survive competition with other businesses.²

Thinking about capital transfers (about ability to make money from education and innovation and vice versa about turning financial resources into a source of social status), scholars acknowledge a connection between people's accumulated capital and social-positioning. *Associated with the role we play and consequently with our status within a society or social group, our **social positioning*** is inseparable from our socio-economic resources, or from the capital accumulated over our life course (Bourdieu 2000, 2006; Nowicka 2013, 2015). Nohl et al. (2006) stress that, particularly for the migrant, capital transfers confirm his/her social position. An indicator of an advantageous capital transfer is an improvement of her/his social positioning within the host culture, diaspora or back home. In other words, migrants' social positioning - especially in the country of destination - depends largely on how they can manage their previously accumulated capital (Nowicka 2015).

In migration scholarship, there is very limited knowledge about nuances of migrants' capital transfers particularly within the transnational context and about their interaction with generated social remittances. It is not completely understood in what ways transnational migrants can generate social remittances from their capital transfers and how those are interacting with the migrants' social positioning.

Looking at 331 narrative, in-depth interviews conducted in 2014-2015 by the ITHACA team members with Bosnian, Ukrainian, Filipino and Indian transnational migrants in Austria, the UK, Italy and Spain; this paper **aims** to explore the interaction of migrants' capital transfers with their social remittances.

The **basic questions** that generate the study are:

1. To what extent - and in what ways – do transnational migrants generate social remittances?
2. How does it interact with their capital transfers and social repositioning?

The interview data have been analysed through the methods of narrative biographical analysis (Creswell 2013; Czarniawska 2004; Elliott 2005). Since the data contain very sensitive biographical material, the informants' names or other identifiable information is not provided in the text. Apart from the complete anonymization of the study participants, the narrative representation of their biographic experiences has been also done, at times, in a composite form for the purposes of confidentiality.

² See Ambrosini (2012, 2014) and Bagwell (2014).

The paper has the following structure. The *Literature Review* introduces the concepts of capital transfer and social remittance and examines their intersection. The *Findings* show different types of capital transfer and different types of social remittances generated by the informants. This section ends with a typology of socially remitting migrants. The *Discussion* invites to think about interaction between social remittances and such processes as social trauma, community building and integration. Looking at motivation for social remittances and conditions of their success and failure; the paper shows that, instead of sharpening the distinction between integration and transnationalism, the migrants' social remittances often illuminate rather complex connections and socio-economic exchanges between the country of origin and the country of destination.

2. Basic Concepts and Critical Issues

Capital transfers

In the field of transnationalism studies, the terms “remittance” and “capital transfer” are often used interchangeably whereas they do not mean the same. A capital transfer is related to the migrant's ability to apply his/her prior knowledge to a new context – that is, to his/her ability to learn and make use of his/her knowledge and skills - an opportunity that is frequently given to him/her in the course of the migratory career.

In his fundamental work, Bourdieu (1985: 19) defines *human capital* as ‘the stock of knowledge, habits, and social and personality attributes... [including] creativity embodied in the ability to perform labour so as to produce economic value’. In migration studies, human capital is consequently seen as any resources accumulated by the migrant during his/her life-course, including knowledge, practical skills, various life experiences and training, and innate abilities and judgment (Nowicka 2013, 2015).

Analysing the work of Bourdieu (1985) in its applications to migration and transnationalism studies, Nowicka (2013: 32) points to the following basic forms of human capital in general and migrants' capital in particular:

1. *economic capital* (personal income and other forms of financial assets);
2. *social capital* (social connections and memberships that provide access to other resources);
3. *cultural capital*, which further consists of:
 - (a) incorporated capital (knowledge, skills, attitudes and mental schemes, which can be unique to each person] and

- (b) *institutionalized capital* (nationally conferred forms of socio-cultural capital such as degrees and qualifications); and
- 4. *symbolic capital* (socio-economic and cultural capital when recognized as legitimate, thus leading to empowerment within the system of recognition).

Bourdieu further clarifies that these forms of human capital can be ‘converted to one another’ with a varied degree of success (Bourdieu 1984, 2006; Nowicka 2013), while a successful capital transfer inevitably involves its *vernacularization* – or the process of adapting the transferred capital to a new (national) context (Holdaway et al. 2015). Scholars admit that, among the variety of capital transfers that take place every day in migrants’ lives, the most crucial for their socio-economic integration is the legal and social recognition of institutionalized cultural capital in the form of the migrants’ prior educational attainments because this capital transfer predetermines their job market opportunities in the country of destination (Nohl et al. 2006; Nowicka 2013). The way migrants make use of their accumulated human capital is interactive with their social positioning – with social roles they play and statuses they hold - within their society or multiple societies, implicating a complex interaction between the spaces created by the country of origin and the country of destination.

The concept of social remittances

Devine (2004) and Nowicka (2015) recognise the complexity around capital transfers. It is important to remember that a capital transfer may not be a straightforward or explicit process. Often conducted unconsciously by the migrant, his/her capital transfers are nevertheless shaped by social relations within a particular community and may therefore eventually produce a societal impact upon this community. From this angle, the recent focus in transnationalism studies has become the concept of *social remittances*, which has been frequently mentioned in scholarship yet not understood precisely (Faist 2010; Levitt & Lamba-Nieves 2011). The concept of social remittances suggests that migrants carry with themselves various forms of non-financial capital [e.g.: norms/ideas, practices/identities and social networks] that shape their encounters with and integration into their host societies and also *send back more than money* (Levitt & Lamba-Nieves 2011). **Social remittances thus convey impact upon society in a non-monetary form as a result of a non-monetary capital transfer or a chain of interconnected capital transfers.**

The impact of social remittances on both the country of origin and the country of destination can be summarized as (Levitt 2001a, 2001b, 2008; Levitt & Lamba-Nieves 2011):

- (a) change of community involvement;
- (b) reconsideration of the historic past; and
- (c) socio-economic improvement, including integration and/or new movements of co-nationals.

Thinking about dissemination of remittances, Cassarino (2004, 2008) argues that migrants' experiences strongly influence what they do in the countries of destination, affecting in return what they remit back home. The circular nature of social remittances is manifested in ways high-skill migrants challenge the host society and enrich its knowledge base by their skills and ideas. Doing this, they themselves *also change* and remit back home *renovated* ideas and practices.

The complex *transnational* nature of social remittances circulation is illuminated by migration of Russian opera singers to Europe. For example, the currently reigning opera diva Anna Netrebko (who had been for years singing in the Vienna Opera and the New York Metropolitan Opera) has caused an immense interest in Russian classic music in the West and in return facilitated new social connections for her home theatre and a new understanding of Puccini in Russia (Dolak 2006; Jeffries 2008). For her social remittances of 'glorifying the great tradition of Russian opera school in the West', she was awarded the State Prize of the Russian Federation in 2004 and the title "People's Artist of Russia" in 2008 (without being physically present in Russia for many years) (Dolak 2006). This example of how social remittances are recognised within the transnational context of the global music industry shows that the world is actually moving toward the acceptance of social remittances as an alternative to physical repatriation and as a new tool to transnationally govern (high-skill) migrations and related competitive advantage. Acceptance of migrants' social remittances fosters creative thinking about talented expatriates and their socio-cultural resources.

The biographical book by Gregory Dolak (2006) shows that Anna Netrebko did not only become a success in her economic capital transfer when her institutionalized capital (professional credentials) from Russia were recognised in Europe and when she started her global career. She also became a success in having made a social remittance out of this transfer. Whether capital transfers result in social remittances or not depends on boundaries between what is established and what is new in a particular national context (Wong & Levitt 2014). Wong and Levitt explain that such 'boundaries can be quite high when adoption requires a major change, or they can be low when what is travelling [as portable capital] has a lot in common with what is already in place' (ibid: 4).

Contexts of social remittances

Although the reality of transnationalism offers many opportunities for successful capital transfers and social remittances, a problem for scholars is that social remittances are often generated unconsciously. In fact, migrating people primarily think in economic terms; and in many cases, economic remittances are

closely intertwined with the processes of building cultural capital and social remittances generation. There is a risk therefore that social remittances may pass unnoticed before the researcher's eye. Thinking about the compound nature of remittance transactions, Carling (2014: 251) points to a number of *cultural scenarios* - or '**remittance scripts**' - around us that, while covering the majority of migrants' economic remittances activities, inevitably create appropriate textures for social remittances:

Remittances are at the core of composite transactions with material, emotional and relational elements. Remittance transfers need to be seen as compound transactions with material, emotional and relational elements. There is indeed diversity of remittance transactions within a single setting (Carling 2014: 218-219).

In the opinion of Carling, the most scientifically precise way to describe such composite remittance transactions is to look at them as socio-cultural "scripts". This notion of remittance scripts is based on the idea that transnational money transfers are always multi-faceted transactions that often involve negotiation, contestation and other interactional processes during which social norms are inevitably touched. Carling (2014: 220) defines scripts as 'structures of expectations for specific types of situations which facilitate social interaction'.³ The notion of the script implicates interplay between the money (material aspect) and the symbol conveyed in this money (its meaning) (Ibid: 220). Tannen (1993) illuminates this interplay with the classic restaurant script or the gastronomic scenario, according to which people may accomplish a variety of socio-cultural activities while consuming food: dating, flirting, talking about movies or business, conducting acts of espionage, etc. On analogy, Billig (1995) shows how such socio-economic scenarios work for the barbershop or pub script, when customers discuss and think over a variety of nation-building issues and thus shape their national identities in barbershop and pubs.

Specifically in relation to remittance scripts, Carling (2014: 227) notes that both parties (the sender and the receiver) have an active role in the transaction. While accepting the remittances, the recipients have many opportunities to exercise agency (Ibid: 229; Richman 2005). Such transactions 'inter-lock the giver and the recipient in a social framework imbued with a range of obligations and meanings' (Cliggett 2003: 543). As Fresnoza-Flot (2009) notes, the money generated during each specific event always has a social meaning. There may be many social remittance scripts around migrants' economic transfers including the 'investment script', the 'charity and donation scripts' and scripts related to professional activities such as

³ This heuristic device has been widely used in social anthropology and social psychology for many years – particularly, in research on gender and family relations (Atwood 1996; Fivush 2006; Stephens & Phillips 2005). However, the works of Billig (1995), Chan (2006), Lerner et al. (2007) and Lubkemann (2005) show that cases of migration and nationalism should be also viewed as happening within scripts.

the script of global academic work, political activism or tourism industry.⁴ The economic activities falling within such scenarios inevitably lead to social remittances. For example, investing in a school or hospital back home, the migrant makes a contribution to the local community development; while charity or religious donations contribute to moral values. Ambrosini (2014: 4) also shows that within the migrant's professional/investment area of *leisure-and-tourism*, transnationalism always has 'a primarily *symbolic* connotation' (Ambrosini 2014: 4). As Carling (2014: 221) further notes, 'remittance scripts are recognized by a social group' [e.g.: diaspora, hometown community in the country of origin, etc.], whose members – both the senders and the receivers - participate in the scripts 'in flexible ways to make sense of specific and recurring remittance transactions'.

Generally speaking, a societal effect is always about *symbolism* – the symbolism conveyed in a particular transaction and embodied in its socio-cultural script. This is what makes the remittance more than just a money donation – the embodied symbolism and its meaning for the community of users. Suggested scripts of social remittances illuminate that there are indeed various factors that affect both capital transfers and social remittances, and these factors may be understood as constituting structures of opportunity related to social remittances. In fact, these factors create environments rich in symbolism [e.g.: professionalism, trauma, etc.] (Ahluwalia 2006; Ambrosini 2012, 2014; Carling 2014; Kahanec & Yuksel 2010; Nowicka 2013, 2015). Referring to the fundamental ideas of Bourdieu (1985), Nowicka (2013, 2015) argues that the factors – and related scripts - of work, trauma and kinship/community are also related to the migrant's social positioning, from which the processes of capital transfer and generation of remittances are inseparable.

Exploring the transnational dissemination of cultural practices across national borders, Wong and Levitt (2014: 4) explain that there are more uncertain contexts or textures of transnationalism, 'such as those plagued by civil unrest or climatic disaster'. They also point that some elements of social remittances may well 'circulate in the context of failed states and markets' (ibid)⁵ – that is, in traumatizing conditions of war and disaster rather than in booming economies because war and trauma always convey very rich symbolism or preconditions for a societal impact (Ahluwalia 2006; Ignatieff 1994). Displaced and globally marginalized people, who are located in extreme traumatizing conditions, are often more likely to adopt radical innovations as they are less bound to restricting norms and obligations (Rogers 2003; Strang & Stroule 1998; Wejner 2002).

⁴ For these and other examples, see Carling (2014: 241-245).

⁵ Wong and Levitt (2014) speak about the circulation of religious practices, which can illuminate the impact of social remittances.

Another symbolic environment (or a social remittance script) can be created by *professionalism* because some professional domains represented by migrants [e.g.: music, art, science] are more symbolic and more based on social networking than others. Scholars believe that high-skill professional migrants play the most crucial role in transferring ideas and practices (Holdaway et al. 2015: 268) because they are more ‘powerful and respected individuals [who can] put pressure on their peers to change’ (Wong & Levitt 2014: 4). Therefore, the transnationalism of educated and affluent migrants who pursue philanthropic homeland projects is usually more ‘advanced’ and more ‘mature’ in terms of its effects than the ‘basic transnationalism’ of low-skill migrants, which is mainly restricted to the family- and household-levels (Ambrosini 2014: 15). Thus there are many scholars who believe that migrants with higher levels of institutionalised capital have better opportunities to generate transnational social remittances (Kivisto 2001; Siar 2012).

Social remittances and integration

Thinking about immigrants’ transnationalism and integration, Lacrouix (2013, 2014) believes that remittances are in many cases just ‘a coping strategy for migrants who strive to manage their multiple integration processes’. Social remittances to the home country may, in fact, raise the immigrant’s employability in the accepting country, especially when his/her career progression is measured by activities of transnationalism such as dependence of the global academic, artistic or business careers on collaborative transnational projects, co-publications or other forms of transnational professional networking (Cantwell 2009; Stiasny & Gore 2013). For example, the economic prosperity of migrant-artists or migrant-millionaires in the West depends on their global public image – on how they are described in western/global mass media, and this is largely impacted by their philanthropic activities back home [e.g.: charity concerts, donations] (Dolak 2006; Ley 2010). The immigrant millionaire or another highly visible and prosperous migrant in the West is expected by the global community to donate money for charity projects back home or to personally engage in such projects (Ley 2010; Raman 2010; Sen 1999). This is what makes her/his public image more attractive (ibid).

The discussion above illuminates, to a certain extent, the interaction between social remittances and socio-economic integration – a relationship that is far from *symmetric* because intensity of social remittances does not always depend on the socio-economic integration (and such factors as career progression and social status) and vice versa (Bagwell 2014; Portes 2003; Mazzucato 2011; Lacroix 2013).

Within the theoretical framework that recognizes the transnational nature of social remittances and their *asymmetric* interaction with integration, there are unanswered questions. In the opinion of Faist (2010), *nuances* of the dynamics of social remittances are not well understood – in particular, their impact upon

integration – actually remains unclear. Thus the overall functioning of global socio-economic institutions (in which the migrant often becomes engaged *by inertia*) makes it obscure under what conditions the migrant generates social remittances as an act of charity versus for a monetary reward (Glick-Schiller 2009). Neither is it clear to what extent the migrant can make social remittances (and of what kind) when becoming marginalized [e.g.: under-scaled, unemployed] in the host society. Moreover, the relationship between social remittances to the home country and those to the host country is understood even less.

This knowledge is important since, although a powerful resource for societal development in the countries of origin and destination, social remittances remain highly under-utilized in both country of origin and country of destination due to the mentioned knowledge gaps and also due to weaknesses of the political opportunity structure (Levitt 201a, 2001b, 2005; Levitt & Lamba-Nieves 2011). Answers to the questions raised above would therefore help to raise public awareness and ability of the government in both countries to develop national strategies to “*accept*” the talent of their immigrants or expatriates (ibid: 24).

In response to these empirical and epistemological shortages, *this paper offers an exploratory study of interaction between capital transfers and social remittances generated by transnational migrants from Philippines, Ukraine, India, Morocco and Bosnia in a number of European countries*. This is a qualitative, exploratory study of nuances of social remittances.

3. Social Remittances from ITHACA

The informants may generate social remittances in the following basic forms:

- Cultural social remittances;
- Ecological social remittances; and
- Political social remittances.

Examples of *cultural social remittances* (which bridge the local and the European culture) include the following cases. A former schoolteacher from Ukraine (a woman of 52), who is now a domestic worker in Italy and who literally lives between her two homes, is going to publish her own book (both in Italian and Ukrainian) about the life of Ukrainian migrants in Italy. A former Ukrainian dressmaker (a woman of 60), who is now found in the similar ontological situation in Italy, runs a clothing business in her country of destination. She has created a network of Italian clients who dress only in her studio. At the moment, she wants to invest the money she has earned from this business in the creation of a new cultural centre for the promotion of Ukrainian culture in Italy. Such social remittances may target to reach a particular local community or all Ukrainian, Moroccan or Indian people in general. They usually result in symbolic products such as the book/movie release and go in couple with *civic* or *ecological* social remittances.

Many “diaspora” theories lay a particular stress on the migrants’ experience of civic participation (Tololyan 2007; Triandafyllidou 2009). In the light of global changes and liberalisation discourses, the sociological understanding of civic engagement has been recently changed toward the notions of social services and human ecology (Kaifeng & Bergrud 2008, 29). Civic engagement is now associated with a broad range of activities that convey people’s “experienced understanding of and emotional meaning to the ideas and spheres of social life” such as community development or environmental protection (Levine 2012, 3). A number of recent studies particularly stress the idea of “*social* civic engagement”, which encompasses a variety of non-political activities such as community building or poverty fighting (Binstock & George 2011; Weissberg 2005).⁶ Broadly speaking, civic participation is closely linked to human ecology because it aims to improve the human eco-system, or the relationships between people and their environments, from the angles of public health and general wellbeing (ibid). Therefore, social remittances generated within this framework can be understood as ‘*civic*’ or ‘*ecological* social remittances’.

Ecological social remittances may thus include such activities as reducing poverty levels and teaching local people basic hygiene. They are widespread among Filipino and Indian migrants. They may be based on rather generous economic transfers and monetary donations from the country of destination – yet not necessarily in all cases. Often migrant women just engage in voluntary activities of counselling and use their informally accumulated capital. The motivation for such activities is mostly to achieve the social position of the hometown community protector, or homeland saviour, and/or to restore the lost social positioning within the diasporic community.

Gloria, a Filipino woman of 61, has been actively involved in an NGO in the UK that provides counselling to abused women and children among migrants, temporary shelter, gender sensitivity training and livelihood skills training. Her co-national Stella (age 66), who has been living in Madrid since 1970, monitors on a voluntary basis several educative and aid projects, teaching poor children back home religion and hygiene. She also supervises a school and a clinic for poor people and the purchasing of boats for Filipino fishers affected by typhoons. This social remittance has been also enabled by the capital transfers from her expanding enterprise in the country of origin, which she owns after the death of her husband. At the same time, she makes a social remittance to the host community by teaching local women the dressmaking- and furniture restoration skills – a professional activity that is based on the qualifications she has received both in the country of origin and the country of destination. Filipino women often generate social remittances in a multi-vector form of dissemination and in a package of soft services.

⁶ See also Isaakyan and Triandafyllidou (Forthcoming).

Other examples include an Indian woman who lives in Spain, regularly travels to India and helps her relatives to run a number of such ecological projects through their local temple. She supports the organization of and donates the money on the construction of schools and vaccination. While running a restaurant and a shop in India, she also brings Spanish cultural items to Indian customers, thus sustaining a complex social remittance scenario. Her co-national from the UK – another Indian lady – is a professional beautician trained both in India and the UK who runs her own beauty salon in London and often travels to India to bring items for her UK business. During her travels, she propagates the European technique of eyebrow threading among local women, which is becoming more and more popular in her Indian hometown.

It is important to note on the “*hometown*” effect of such social remittances. In migration studies, the “hometown” concept relates to a relatively small and geographically bounded community in the country of origin from which the migrant originates [e.g.: the migrants’ village, native town or a particular wider region such as Punjab]. Since ecological involve rather complex investments and frequent transnational travels, they are more easily accomplished within the hometown framework: in fact, it is much easier to fight poverty and to improve public health on the level of one’s native town rather than nation-state. Levitt (2001a; Levitt 2001b) observes that many villages and small towns back home have been revitalized and redeveloped through such remittances.

Transnational migrants often use hometown associations to disseminate their ecological social remittances because this process needs constant supervision. Such ecological social remittances may connect the migrants’ hometown associations in the country of origin and diasporic associations in the country of destination into the overall administrative mechanism for social remittances [e.g.: the cases of Indians and Moroccans] and may also intersect with political social remittances as they both reach the sphere of public life.

Searching for empowerment, migrants often engage in **political transnationalism**, which creates rich social remittance scripts. Immigrant political transnationalism covers any political activity undertaken by migrants and relates to such dimensions of citizenship as being a public activist and being a good citizen (Martiniello & Lafleur 2008: 655). Political transnationalism and related social remittances are especially important for migrants who come from countries affected by reconciliation politics (such as Bosnia)⁷ or currently placed in the war conditions (such as Ukraine).⁸

⁷ The fall of the Berlin Wall had led to tensions between Federalist (Serbs) and Separatist branches in the government of the former Yugoslavia. As a result, a civil war took place in Bosnia (1992-1995) between the pro-devolution Bosnian-Croat

Political social remittances generated by our informants are related to such activities and scripts of political transnationalism as protests to recognize the Bosnian genocide, military propaganda of the Maidan army in Ukraine, development of certain projects to protect co-nationals' rights. These activities may have different degrees of intensity and may actually intersect with ecological initiatives. For example, Drago, a Bosnian man in late twenties, lives in Austria and attends a lot of protests regarding the rights of gay people and genocide memory.

In general, many informants try to help their co-nationals in emigration to defend their human rights and to either return or stay and seek better employment. This is one of the most frequent social remittances across national contexts. In many cases, provided assistance to co-nationals comes in the form of 'moral support', accompanied with coaching in basic survival skills upon settlement or repatriation:

I help others to return or to engage in similar back-and-forth [transnational work] activities. There are many people who came to the UK at the age of twenty-two on student visas. They were promised work security but instead had to do manual jobs. They are constantly abused by their employers and recruitment agencies. Some of them have lived in the UK for years and reached the age 54. They may now want to go home. I help them through my NGO. I am involved in activism for fighting for migrants' rights (*Filipino man from the UK, age 50*).

The suggested typology of the socially remitting migrant (see below) is based on the interplay of such factors of social remittances as integration, diasporic engagement and capital transfer – rather than on statistical prevalence.

The typology of the socially remitting migrant

On the basis of the interview data, it is possible to develop a typology of transnational migrants who actively generate social remittances. The following cases of the "socially remitting migrant" illuminate the interplay of various factors of transnationalism:

(Contd.) _____

alliance and the Serbs. The Serb armed forces carried on a number of genocidal activities- abusing, massacring and displacing thousands of Bosnians and Croats. According to the International Criminal Tribunal, by 1999 1 million Bosnians had been displaced from their homes. The atrocities were especially severe in the city of Prijedor (part of Serbia), where most people were displaced and only 40% returned. For more information, see Kahanec and Yuksel (2010) and Kelly (2003).

⁸ For the history and dynamics of the 2014 Russian-Ukrainian conflict, see: <http://www.summer.harvard.edu/blog-news-events/conflict-ukraine-historical-perspective>.

1. Filipino and Ukrainian domestic workers in Spain, Italy and the UK who generate ecological and cultural social remittances;
2. Ukrainian and Bosnian high-skill migrants in Austria and the UK who generate militant and politically oriented social remittances;
3. Indian high-skill migrants in Austria and the UK who generate cultural and professionally organized social remittances; and
4. Moroccan high-skill migrants in Italy who generate cultural and professionally organized social remittances.

Type 1: Filipino/Ukrainian domestic workers

This category of the remitting migrant can be illuminated by the following two life-stories.

Case 1.1. Aurora: age mid-fifties, Filipino in Italy, single, holds BSc in Commerce with Major in Banking and Finance from the country of destination

She came to work in Italy in 1984 as an illegal migrant and remained undocumented until 1987 while working as a domestic worker. Her motivation was to earn some money to open her own business. In 1990 she set up a company in Italy that offered business services to provide assistance with the paper work for Filipinos who wanted to migrate to Italy. She was sharing this company with two other partners, who embezzled her. She found herself bankrupt while her reputation within her diasporic community was damaged. That is why she left for the Philippines in 1995.

She stayed in her country of origin for five years and opened her own business - a family restaurant - but she went bankrupt again due to a competition with Chinese migrants. In fact, she had to sell her house in the Philippines and half of the land property that her father had passed on to her to repay her debts. She lost her economic capital, which had been invested in that business.

In 2001, she returned to Italy and started working again as domestic worker. It was her sister who was still in Italy and who had enabled her return in order to restart the accumulation of new economic and cultural capital – in order to restore her savings and also her reputation among the Filipino community. Those two forms of capital were interconnected.

Having achieved this two-fold task in four years, Aurora initiated a new company in Italy - a telephone centre for post-9/11 security checks, which again closed down as a temporary project. Ineffectual in the economic capital transfers, she nevertheless became a success in generating social remittances: she was a key actor in setting up one of the Filipino Honorary Consulates in Italy. She is extremely active among the

migrant associations and very well networked with them. She travels back home as part of the humanitarian mission to engage in fundraising and to help their community after the disaster of the typhoon in 2014.

Case 1.2: Luna, age late forties, Filipino in the UK

Luna is an experienced transnational domestic worker who started her domestic labour career in Singapore and Hong Kong and later moved to the UK following her Hong-Kong employer. She is a single mother who has eventually managed to bring her children to the UK.

She finds her relocation to the UK advantageous from the economic perspective because this job allows her to make quite successful economic capital transfers: she has a secure income (£1,000 a month), which fully covers the mortgage of the house back home. She has bought that house in Manila for her sister and her kids (her sister is also a single mother). She has also bought a coconut plantation for her father (14 hectares of land).

While in the UK, she consistently helps other Filipinos return, including domestic workers who are overstressed, malnourished or abused. She acts as their intermediary to the Filipino embassy and various NGOs back home.

Both Aurora and Luna generate their social remittances independently from their economic capital transfers and economic remittances. For them, social remittances become a source of new – very positive - social repositioning within their diasporic communities, in which they are successfully integrated. Their histories of capital transfers and remittances generation illuminate the importance of female diasporic solidarity – when female relatives and single mothers help each other.

This category of the socially remitting migrant is mostly comprised of highly educated middle-age women (in their middle forties through late fifties), who find themselves de-skilled professionally as domestic workers in emigration – yet re-skilled through their social remittance activities. For example, having accumulated a lot of informal cultural capital related to her humanitarian social remittances, Aurora has undergone professional accreditation to be qualified as a social worker if she returns home. Their social remittances are mostly of the humanitarian – ecological and cultural – nature, directed both at their hometown communities back home and diasporic communities in emigration.

Type 2: Highly skilled Ukrainian/Bosnian men

Case 2.1: Andrei, age late twenties, businessman

Andrei worked for a US company in Ukraine and decided to study for an MBA in the UK. He received the student loan through the London School of Economics where he did his Master's degree. His father also gave him all his savings of \$5,000. He came to the UK as a student but later opened a legal consultancy business to be able to stay in this country after graduation. At the moment, he is struggling with finding customers for the business and remitting all the money earned to Ukraine to support the Ukrainian army. Since the beginning of the Russian-Ukrainian war, he and his friends set up an activity group in London, fundraising money for the Maidan Army.

Case 2.2: Ivan, age 28, degree in International Law, from Eastern Ukraine

Having worked for an agricultural firm in Ukraine, Ivan came to the UK as a transnational company employee to develop their business in London. Since the outbreak of the post-2014 war in Ukraine, he has been involved in transnational political activism, generating economic remittances through unregistered activities. These remittances support the Ukrainian national movement both economically and socially: the generated money is used for buying weapons and providing medical help to the Ukrainian fighters.

Within this category, there are many men in their late twenties and early thirties who settle in the UK as highly skilled migrants. Their formal capital is often accumulated in UK universities and workplaces while economic remittances to support militant projects of homeland restoration involve a lot of propaganda at both ends and thus fall under a complex remittance script of warfare and war propaganda within the texture of traumatized society.

Type 3: High-skill migrants from India

This type of the socially remitting migrant is comprised of highly educated Indians in their mid-thirties through late forties, who came to the EU as high-skill professionals or immigrant-entrepreneurs and whose capital transfers and social remittances are organized across professional lines.

Case 3.1: John, age late thirties, businessman

While having his own hotel business in India for many years, John came to Austria ten years ago as an entrepreneur and transferred his Indian capital to open a shop in Austria. He opened an online shop specializing in Ayurveda products. He had chosen this business because of its potential for generating social remittances: John always wanted to do something for the European community. Through this business, he now generates social remittances to the host – European – society and aims to educate

European people on the issues of their health and hygiene – ‘to give them knowledge about their own health’, as he himself says. His shop is now expanding and his social remittances are making a global effect as more and more Europeans from different countries are buying his products. He wants not only to supply the Ayurveda products to his European customers but also to educate them on the appropriate consumption mode.

Alongside with this, his long-term tourism business in India is also expanding. Apart from having a hotel, he has the 4000m² land property on the beach in his Indian hometown, which he plans to turn into ‘a very beautiful holiday place’ to match the European standards.

Although he runs two different enterprises (one in India and one in Austria), they are inter-connected and not only through his frequent travels but also through a chain of overlapping capital transfers and herein generated social remittances – the social remittances that aim at consumer education and hometown revival.

Case 3.2: Jenny, age late thirties

Jenny is a professional Indian dancer, who has been transnational for a long time because of the tour requirement for her job. In 2008, she came to Austria for a collaborative dance project based on the collaboration between Indian and Austrian artists. Then she married an Austrian man and settled in Austria. She has a private dance studio in both India and Austria and a stable contingent of students, with whom she has been working for years. She spends half a year on travelling to India and all around the world and on giving performances, which are related to her job. The circle of her students in Austria is becoming more international, and she disseminates her social remittances now not only to India and Austria but also to the global community. Apart from teaching the Indian dance, she teaches her European students the Indian mythology and culture.

The social remittances of such migrants directly interact with their careers and economic investments into their careers. Their professional activities such as dance teaching or hotel business presuppose, from the very beginning, complex socio-cultural scripts with many opportunities for the social impact. Scholarship generally recognizes the important role of the highly educated nucleus of the Indian diaspora and related diasporic philanthropic activities in their country of origin. Scholars especially acknowledge the impact of

Indian Punjabi diasporics upon the development of their hometowns and the overall engagement of the Indian diaspora in the economic and socio-cultural aspects of India.⁹

Type 4: Highly skilled Moroccans in Italy

Case 4.1. Nadira: age 43, schoolteacher and researcher

Nadira is a foreign language teacher in an Italian school and a freelance researcher in the area of cross-cultural communication. She holds university degrees in Languages and Translation from Morocco and Germany. She generates cultural and ecological social remittances both to her country of origin and country of destination. Her social remittances are of two types – cross-cultural exchange (whose main beneficiaries are Italian people) and improving public health of Moroccan people back home. The cross-cultural exchange between Italy and Morocco is contributed by her professional experience and the nature of her work. As a language teacher and cultural mediator, she organizes trips to Morocco for her Italian colleagues in order to show them the real Moroccan culture, to expand their knowledge about the world beyond Europe and to strengthen herein the socio-cultural aspect of the Morocco-Italy migration corridor:

I wanted to show them parts of Morocco you would not normally see as a tourist. I thought it would be useful to share my knowledge about Morocco with the people I work with in Italy. I also thought this was a way to do some good for my country [Morocco]. I brought my colleagues into my family house and many other private places. The trip took eight days, and it was not part of any official programme. All the participants paid for themselves to cover the expenses. After the trip, one of the participants prepared a collection of pictures that we sold (*Nadira, age 43*).

This powerful social remittance involves a chain of capital transfers. Although it was organized on a voluntary basis, Nadira actively used her professional channels - the social capital from her current job. Nadira's employment in this school has been previously enabled not through the recognition of her Moroccan educational credentials but through her acquisition of a new degree from a European country. Thus her institutionalized capital obtained in the country of origin was not recognized but added to the new institutional capital accumulated in the region of destination. This complex transfer (*capital vernacularization*) enabled her to find high-skill employment with necessary social connections. In this way, she accumulated new economic and social capital, necessary for her social remittances.

⁹ See Dusenbury and Tatla (2010).

The cultural exchange activity emerging from this transaction produced another form of economic capital in her country of destination – the money invested by her colleagues participating in the trip - which was then translated into a new cultural experience and a new form of material and cultural capital such as the picture album. The book was sold in the country of destination and a new form of economic capital was used to enable a charity script leading to a prolific community development transaction in the country of origin: the money from the book sale was used to provide medical care for sick children in Morocco. This multi-layered socio-economic transaction illuminates the development of two distinct yet intersecting social remittances, whose beneficiaries were both Moroccans and Italians – as well as a transnational flow and reciprocity between different forms of capital.

This multi-layered script of tourism and charity was also enabled by Nadira's prior experience of physical trauma and suffering. It was not by chance that she chose the area of medical care for poor children in Morocco as an outlet for the newly accumulated economic capital (money raised by the book sale). A few years before, she had undergone an ear surgery and quite painful rehabilitation, which made her concerned about the absence of such services in her country of origin. She later expanded the range of her charity scripts and community development projects by regularly sending Moroccan children clothes and by monitoring a long-distance adoption programme. Her traumatic experience had thus become her symbolic capital: it had enabled her to locate other forms of cultural capital and to facilitate other rounds of capital exchange and social remittances.

Case 4.2. Latika: age 50, international project coordinator

Latika is also a trained philologist, with specialization in Arabic Literature. Unable to have her Moroccan degrees (institutionalized capital from the country of origin) recognised in Italy, she enrolled in various university courses in Italy and found a job of project coordinator in one of the Italy-based NGO that deal with immigration issues. Through her professional contacts, she generates various kinds of cultural and ecological social remittances in both the country of origin and country of destination. For example, through the partnership with an Italian university, her NGO organizes cross-cultural exchange trips between Italian and Moroccans students and professors. Apart from that, her NGO enables moral and financial support for Moroccan entrepreneurs who settle in Italy. At the moment, she is planning to open a school in her Moroccan hometown on the money saved from her Italian work.

Latika, Nadira and many other Moroccans in Italy present an interesting case of the successful producer of social remittances. They generate complex social remittance scripts, based on the combination of cultural exchange and civic participation and successfully accepted by both local people in Morocco and host people in Italy. The success of the social remittance scripts, enabled through their capital transfers, is

attributed to several factors. They often use professional channels and the social capital facilitated through such channels. This is possible because they hold high-skill jobs as an outcome of their continuous education in the country of origin. Although their migration to Italy and the Moroccan diasporic initiatives and organizations are relatively young, the Moroccan community is very united,¹⁰ which makes us think about a rather complex interaction between various factors of social remittances at play in both country of origin and the country of destination.

4. Discussion

Revising Conditions for Social Remittances

The suggested types of the *socially remitting migrant* are based on and illuminative of the dynamics of social remittances conditions. These conditions involve a complex interplay of capital transfers and certain features of local and global contexts. In order to understand how – in what conditions – social remittances are generated by the migrants, we need to think about how social remittances are being sent. In this connection, Carling (2014) notes on the twofold effect of any remittance transaction – upon the sender and upon the receiver – and on the complex chain of meanings emerging from their interaction. In other words, the question about in what conditions social remittances are generated successfully should be split into the following two sub-questions: (a) which factors enable the sender (the migrant) to produce and to send his/her social remittances; and (b) which factors enable the receiver (people left in the country of origin or hosts and other migrants in the place of destination) to accept and benefit from social remittances.

Generated and consumed as a result of capital transfers, social remittances themselves become a particular form of transferred capital. For example, the hometown community reviving ideas and practices often emerge from monetary donations and investments, which are generated from the migrant's income in the country of destination. Like in the case of Filipino domestic workers in Europe, this process may be supplemented with a transfer of their previously accumulated cultural capital, including prior professional skills. Successfully accepted social remittances [e.g.: a new local school or community development programme] may create a new form of prestige for the sending migrant and a new form of re-positioning

¹⁰ See Bartolomeo et al. (2015).

within the diaspora, which in itself is a rather complex transfer of cultural and symbolic capital, with a potential to enable the migrant's career.

Scripts of professionalism

When we think about the effect of social remittances on the sender and about his/her capacity to generate social remittances in emigration, the following factors may come into play. In the country of destination, these factors involve the role of such interstitial spaces as diaspora and post-modern/global work (or globalizing business). The migrant's ability to create certain ideas and cultural projects may be directly dependent upon her/his status in the diaspora and its associations: various immigrant-oriented NGOs and the global logistics of academic work or business in the West may be quite supportive of cultural exchange (cultural capital transfers) and various transnational activities from which social remittances often derive.

Very often, highly educated transnational migrants organize their social remittances *across professional lines* – that is, as part of their job routine. Thus international networking and travelling become an inseparable part of certain careers (for example, for academics and musicians), and professional migrants engage in such activities because this cultural capital transfer is important for their career development. Sometimes, such activities are conducted out of (women's) solidarity. For example, an Indian woman in the UK who has found an academic position in a private UK university through her diasporic Indian networks now does the same to others - both as part of her professionalism and social positioning. Another Indian woman, who is a scientist and a human geographer, regularly travels to India for her academic projects and engages in a range of ecological activities there during her travels.

The conditions in which highly qualified migrants work – the *overall logistics* of their high-skill jobs – may create powerful socio-economic scripts for social remittances that emerge from their professional activities. This relates to the increased role of transnationalism as a norm for academic work, global business, sport or legal protection of migrants. For example, Fikhrat from Morocco (age 39) has founded the Italian-Moroccan Association of Martial Arts in one of Italian cities because one of its members was a former champion of martial arts in Morocco. They have opened a new gym on the community donations and launched several activities to facilitate integration of foreigners in their Italian city and increase the cultural link between them and local people. As Fikhrat says, 'The spirit of these initiatives is to put together young Italians and foreigners and promote community development through sport'.

His female co-national Baguira (age 38), is a trained lawyer who has also received the law degree from Italy and now works on issues of immigrants' legalization. She deals with public institutions in Italy and Morocco (including the Moroccan Embassy in Italy and the Italian Consulate in Morocco. She says: 'My

professional background and experience obviously make it easy for me to engage in this activity. Having studied and worked in the area of Italian legal skills, I can be of great help for my clients. Using my professional skills, I have developed strong links with and between Italy and Morocco’.

The factor of professionalism throws light on the complex relationship between the country of origin and the country of destination, which is manifested in how credentials and qualifications from the country of origin are recognized or used as a form of capital in emigration. The informants admit having problems with their degrees/qualifications recognition. Thus degrees received in Bosnia, Ukraine or Morocco were not converted as such into new forms of economic capital in the country of destination. In order to use their professionalism as a source of empowerment and income, the informants had to either supplement it with other forms of capital or to receive a new degree from their country of destination.

Related to migrants’ employment in the new country of their settlement, the labour-market effect upon generation of social remittances can be also instrumental in how effectively capital transfers work. For example, the informal job market of domestic work, which is proliferating in a number of European countries, continues to actively employ foreign highly qualified female migrants and to form a particular immigrant niche for Filipinos and Ukrainians in such regions as Southern Europe and the UK, sustains a complex interactional chain of their capital transfers (Cuban 2013; Marchetti 2014). It gives migrants the money (new economic capital) to enable a particular remittance script of donation, charity or help such as a local school or community development project. The case of Filipino/Ukrainian domestic workers in Europe actually shows highly qualified people who were not able to locate resources for an impact upon their communities prior to emigration.¹¹ And in emigration, they actually failed to transfer their institutionalized capital such as their degrees to the new context and to make a profit by this capital. In this connection, such forms of the country of origin capital were a-symbolic – that is not leading to any empowerment. However, their prior knowledge and professional skills were successfully translated into the logistics of the informal market of domestic work in their countries of destination.¹² Their newly accumulated economic capital (added by their drive for social repositioning) became an investment in their social remittances back home.

Traumatic scripts

In terms of how social remittances are received, there may be the following factors at work in the place of origin. Regarding the receiver of social remittances, a natural disaster such as a hurricane in Philippines or

¹¹ See Kofman (2013) and Marchetti (2014).

¹² See Ibid.

flooding in Bosnia may strengthen the donation/charity script by sharpening the receiver's need for help. In this connection, Vertovec (2009) notes on the intensifying effect of such events upon social remittances.

The local market dynamics in the country of origin may become another decisive contributor to social remittances [e.g.: the case of Aurora]. As related to the logistics of the national labour market in the country of origin, the overall level of societal *corruption* disrupt the processes of sending and receiving social remittances, which is evident in all presented countries of destination. The informant below admits that the state corruption in his place of origin always disrupts intended cultural capital transfers by annihilating any chances for using professional skills mastered in emigration:

I know people who had returned to Ukraine to set up a business but they were quickly disappointed by high taxes, bureaucracy – the state is squeezing rather than helping them. The Ukrainian educational system is out of date: people who have studied abroad cannot find work in academia in Ukraine. Ukrainians do not go back because they do not know what to do with their skills (*Ukrainian woman from the UK, age 48*).

Another example is a sixty-year-old man who has returned from Italy to Morocco and tried to launch a project through his local NGO. They wanted to create a shopping centre like in Europe – with such social remittance scripts as café, restaurant, games and sports for children. But in spite of the public support, the municipality of his hometown in Morocco has put this project on hold.

As evident, the majority of social remittances back home target the hometown population. As noted by one of the UK-based Indian informants, 'I come from a village in India where there are only farmers. I want to change this and give them new skills to start manufacturing. I want to turn local women into entrepreneurs'.

The *hometown* ethos is extremely important for a successful acceptance of social remittances. This explains why social remittances of Bosnian migrants may often fail: the reason is that, in many cases, the informant's hometown [e.g.: Prijedor, etc.] has been destroyed by the war and still bears the mental traces of the atrocities that do not allow local people to open up for a social change. Ismar (age 58) – a trained mining engineer who now lives in Austria - admits that he has recently denied a prestigious job offer to work as director of mines back in Prijedor [which would enable him to disseminate social remittances such as new entrepreneurial and managerial skills] only because his family members were executed there during the war.

Thinking about the impact of societal trauma upon social remittances, we can clearly see a complex interplay between the country of origin and the country of destination through the connection between the

migrant's remittances and her/his hometown in the country of origin – *a powerful transnational relationship that resonates with the phenomenon of 'transnational village'*.¹³ The context of the war trauma may indeed have a rather powerful – yet extremely controversial - effect upon the success of social remittances. It may both impede and facilitate their generation. For example, a Ukrainian woman from the UK (age 48) notes that many things are now positively changing in Ukraine with the post-2014 war: people are hoping for the EU membership. To achieve this, they are willing to learn new social skills and therefor becoming more polite with returning migrants, who are viewed as harbingers of such social change. But on the other hand, Ukrainian people may be frightened to accept such social remittances because of the societal “spy”-paranoia: local people are afraid of Russian spies and saboteurs, and consequently of learning new things from outsiders.

The informants stress that the sharpening socio-cultural gap between Ukrainians and Russians may severely obstruct dissemination of social remittances. In this connection, the conflict between Ukraine and Russia has particularly affected the “ethnic-shop” script. For example, Volod (a Ukrainian man of 31) has made a complex round of capital transfers in the country of destination (from irregular work in masonry, bartending and gardening to a small ethnic enterprise) to eventually open a Ukrainian-and-Russian product store in 2011 in Italy. Since he has both Ukrainian and Russian customers, he now has ‘to be very careful in using the correct words and mediating tensions between Russian and Ukrainian customers in the shop’. The politics of reconciliation may thus become a direct contributor to the acceptance of social remittances in the country of origin. However, this relationship is not symmetric. The Bosnian and Ukrainian examples show that in some cases, a traumatic memory or a war conflict can make local people more open for a cultural change and consequently social remittances; while in other cases, the local society may become more divided and rather difficult to manage in terms of social remittances.

The problem of divided choices and alliances is always an aftermath of traumatized, war-afflicted societies (Ahluwalia 2006; Ignatieff 1994). In this connection, unfinished politics of reconciliation may disrupt a social remittance script because the migrant himself may be faced with extremely difficult moral choices. For example, if an intended social remittance aims at community development in the migrants’ hometown where atrocities took place and involves transnational travels, its implementation may be quite problematic for the migrant. S/he may find it very challenging to regularly visit the place of his/her origin, which bears traces and provokes memories of those horrible events; or just imagine local people, half of whom were the perpetrators, as the beneficiaries of his/her remittances. The sender’s moral choice is an

¹³ For more on the effect of ‘transnational village’ - or on the connectivity between the migrant’s place/community of origin and his/her socio-economic activities in the country of destination - see Levitt (2008).

important factor of social remittances. For example, Ismar - a geo-mining Bosnian engineer from Austria – comes from the town of Prijedor, whose Bosnian community was massacred during the conflict. He confesses that the most tragic for him is to see the perpetrators walking in the street and drinking coffee in the same shops. When going back to his native town, it is the worst experience for Ismar to realise that ‘the International Criminal Court was just a fake and that those who killed thousands of innocent people got only fifteen years of prison’. This circumstance has made the highly qualified – and even elite - professional Ismar a very pessimistic sender of social remittances.

The traumatized/divided society often makes a controversial effect upon various categories of actors involved in social remittances: local people in the place of origin, diasporic people and consequently hosts in the place of destination (Ahluwalia 2006; Ignatieff 1994; Kahanec & Yuksel 2010). For example, in the UK and Austria, there are many migrants from the former Yugoslavia who are of the Serbian origin and who therefore share a different perspective on the Serbian-Bosnian conflict, which may consequently influence attitudes of the host population.

The societal war trauma is thus a rather “heavy” factor of social remittances for people both in the country of origin and the country of destination, while more culturally embedded phenomena [e.g.: Filipinos’ Christianity, Moroccans’ Islam, etc.] may result in social remittances accepted more easily by the host society in the country of settlement. The work of Levitt (2008) shows how religion enables very powerful scripts for migrants’ civic engagement and generation of social remittances.¹⁴

Opening migration corridors

Active cultural ambassadors of Islam, Moroccan migrants in Italy are very efficient in their social remittances, which are often grounded in their professionalism (cultural capital from the country of origin). In this respect, their group portfolio may bear resemblance with the Indian entrepreneurs in the UK and Austria. However, the case of Moroccans in Italy is distinct. Contrasting with the highly skilled Indians in Europe, the institutional capital of Moroccans (their qualification and degrees) from their country of origin was not de facto recognised in their country of destination. In order to become successful social remitters and cultural ambassadors, they had to obtain *new forms* of institutionalized capital from their place of destination (Italian/European degrees) – which, together with their previously accumulated knowledge, skills and social connections started to work as social remittances factors.

¹⁴ See also Ahluwalia (2006).

Second, their social remittances go in a complex package in many cases, including socio-cultural and educational services through diasporic and hometown NGOs, both civic and cultural exchange activities, and also activities for host people in Italy. Here we can assume that the famous Morocco-Italy corridor has implications subtler than geographical proximity: it becomes a *symbolic transnational corridor* or a specific *social remittance script*. In its impact upon the host population in the country of destination, the *symbolic transnational corridor* – or the *corridor script* – means that Italian people do not only have an opportunity to easily visit Morocco. (Austrian people also have an opportunity to travel to Bosnia or Ukraine due to their geographical proximity.) Italians may also enjoy imagining Morocco as an interesting country to visit and to learn about, even without having ever been there. This is perhaps where the effect of cultural social remittances that are grounded in migrants' religion (Islam) becomes more powerful than that of reconciliation politics.

The success of Moroccan social remittances for the host society can be also explained by the socio-cultural congruence and unity of its diaspora, which compensates for the relatively young diasporic policy initiatives.¹⁵ In contrast, the Bosnian diaspora in the UK or Austria is very disconnected as a result of their traumatized and divided society back home. That is why, in spite of a large number of Bosnian diasporic organizations, their social remittances for the host society are less successful than those of Moroccans.¹⁶

Is the place important?

The non-linear (asymmetric) relationship between generation of social remittances and socio-economic integration may make social remittances appear, to a certain extent, independent from the country of destination. However, this is not always so. While social remittances are often produced in the conditions of marginalization and under-employment, the presence of the country of destination in the remitter's living space is important for their generation: the place of destination always provides the migrant with some form of new capital as a necessary resource for social remittances. This new capital may come either as money or as a drive for self-repositioning. In many cases, social remittances become interrupted or weakened when the migrant returns. The Ukrainian examples show that social remittances are continued because Ukrainians who were interviewed in Ukraine can be conceptualized not as "returnees" but as "circulating migrants", in whose lives the country of destination is always present.

What is also interesting here is that the locally textured social remittances (such as socio-cultural or educational support of the migrant's hometown community somewhere in India or Philippines) are often

¹⁵ See Di Bartolomeo et al. (2015).

¹⁶ See Kelly (2003). See also: Kahanec and Yuksel (2010).

generated through global channels: the migrant has to leave her country of destination in order to produce this social remittance. This is the case with the under-scaled domestic workers as well as economically well integrated transnational academics and businessmen. While based in the country of origin, they were very inactive social remitters. Only after they had established themselves professionally in the country of destination (through its formal or hidden economy), they started to generate social remittances back home, which is perhaps another manifestation of how glocalization works through transnationalism.¹⁷ It is the country of destination that makes the migrant transnational – that is living as a sojourner – which is a different socio-cultural experience and a powerful factor of social remittances compared with a permanent stay in one's country of origin.

Gender also plays a role in social remittances. Thus migrant women tend more to support each other through their social remittances: our female informants often provide specific socio-cultural services to other women migrants. Also women seem to engage in cultural and civic participation projects back home more actively; while men [e.g.: Bosnians, Ukrainians] are more involved in political and warfare projects. However, more research is needed on this particular issue.¹⁸

5. Concluding remarks

The ITHACA study shows that transnational migrants from all five countries of origin actively disseminate social remittances even in the conditions of weak socio-economic integration. And the relationship between social remittances and integration is not linear: it would be rather simplistic to assume that the better integration – the more active or more powerful social remittances. In some cases, social remittances back home or within one's diasporic community may become a gateway to socio-cultural integration, like in the case of Aurora. In other cases, a social remittance may become an outcome of economic and cultural integration, in the course of which the migrants manage to successfully accomplish a number of capital transfers. This is shown in the cases of John, Jenny and other Indian migrants, whose enriched professionalism creates conditions for social remittances.

Their social remittances can be divided into three basic – yet often intersecting - categories:

1. *Cultural social remittances* (related to cross-cultural exchange between the migrant's multiple homelands);
2. *Ecological social remittances* (related to civic participation or community development); and

¹⁷ See also Bagwell (2014) and Levitt (2001a, 2001b).

¹⁸ See Yuval-Davis (1997). See also Ignatieff (1994).

3. *Political social remittances* (related to the migrants' political activism).

Amidst various forms of social remittances generated by the informants, the most frequent activities are:

- a) moral support for co-national diasporics;
- b) poverty-fighting projects in the country of origin, based both on monetary donations and transnational travel; and
- c) opening/running an ethnic restaurant or shop in either the country of origin or the country of destination.

As transnational migrants, the informants can be generally divided into the following three types, based on their interplay of factors of social remittances:

1. the Filipino/Ukrainian domestic worker who sends ecological and cultural social remittances back home;
2. the highly skilled Indian/Moroccan migrant who makes social remittances both locally and globally; and
3. the Bosnian/Ukrainian migrant who is involved in political projects of reconciliation and homeland-restoration.

The findings show that, in spite of the global flows of the migrants' mobility and accumulated capital, their social remittances are, in many cases, locally directed toward the migrant's hometown in the country of origin and dependent on such local-context factors as community dynamics and societal trauma or political conflict in the country of origin – rather than on the globally expanding economic crisis. In many cases, capital transfers and social remittances of our informants have not been seriously affected by the current financial crisis but have been significantly shaped by such local or national events as the Russian-Ukrainian conflict, Bosnian trauma, natural catastrophe in the country of origin, or personal (traumatic) experience.

However, the overall – *glocal* – dynamics of social remittances is rather complex and constituted by a multitude of overlapping factors, each worth a separately conducted study. These factors relate both to the country of origin and country of destination and include the role of interstitial spaces such as diaspora and globalizing career; the second economy (informal job market) of the country of destination; general levels of societal tolerance; as well as additional factors of gender and migration corridor.

While looking at these findings and the interplay of social remittances, it makes sense to reconsider the concept of “migration corridor”, which is particularly illuminated by the “Moroccans-in-Italy” case. The suggested notion of *symbolic corridor* means a socio-cultural space created through social remittances – a space within which host people without mobility experience become beneficiaries of migrants’ social remittances.

References

- Ahluwalia, P. (2006). *Violence and Non-Violence*. London: Routledge.
- Akresh, I. (2006). 'Occupational mobility among legal immigrants to the United States', *International Migration Review* 40(4): 854-884.
- Ambrosini, M. (2012). 'Migrants' entrepreneurship in transnational social fields: Research in the Italian context', *International Review of Sociology* 273-292.
- Ambrosini, M. (2014). 'Migration and Transnational Commitment: Some Evidence from the Italian Case', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 40 (4): 619–37.
- Atwood, J. (1996). *Family Scripts*. London: Routledge.
- Bagwell, S. (2014). 'Transnational entrepreneurship: Amongst Vietnamese businesses in London', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 41(2): 329-349.
- Basch, L., N. Glick-Schiller, and C. Szanton-Blanc. (1994). *Nations Unbound: Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments, and Deterritorialized Nation-States*. Taylor & Francis.
- Bermudez Torres, A. (2006). 'Colombian migration to Europe', COMPAS Working Papers 37.
- Billig, M. (1995). *Banal Nationalism*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Binstock, R. and L. George. (2011). *Handbook of Aging and the Social Sciences*. Amsterdam: Elsevier.
- Black, R. and A. Castaldo. (2007). 'Return migration and entrepreneurship in Ghana and Cote D'Ivoire: The role of capital transfers', *The Royal Dutch Geographical Society KNAG* 100(1): 44-58.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1985). 'Social space and the genesis of groups', *Theory and Society* 14(6): 723-744.
- Bourdieu, P. (1990). *The Logic of Practice*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bourdieu, P. (1993). *Sociology in Question*. London: Sage.
- Bourdieu, P. (1994). *In Other Words: Essays Towards a Reflexive Sociology*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1997). *Pascalian Meditations*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (2000). 'Making the economic habitus: Algerian workers revisited', *Ethnography* 1(1): 17-41.
- Bourdieu, P. (2006). 'The forms of capital', in H. Lauder (Ed.) *Education, Globalization and Social Change*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Pp.105-118.
- Bourdieu, P. and L. Wacquant. (1992). *An Invitation to Reflexive Sociology*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Brickell, K. and A. Datta. (2011). *Translocal Geographies: Spaces, Places, Connections*. Ashgate.
- Available at:

- <http://books.google.it/books?hl=en&lr=&id=ygV8b3ahe9cC&oi=fnd&pg=PR7&dq=translocal+geographies:+spaces,+places+and+connections&ots=AFvEbWYW92&sig=XPTampeZrUzemoMypXsdxo2J2Jw>.
- Bryceson, D. and U. Vuorela. (2002). *The Transnational Family: New European Frontiers and Global Networks. Cross-Cultural Perspectives on Women*. Oxford.
- Cantwell, J. (2009). 'Location and the multinational enterprise', *Journal of International Business Studies* 40: 35-41.
- Carling, J. (2014). 'Scripting remittances: Making sense of money transfers in transnational relationships', *International Migration Review* 48(1): 219-262.
- Cassarino, J.-P. (2004). 'Theorising Return Migration: The Conceptual Approach to Return Migrants Revisited', *International Journal on Multicultural Societies* 6 (2): 253–79.
- Cassarino, J.-P. (2008). 'Patterns of Circular Migration in the Euro-Mediterranean Area: Implications for Policy-Making', CARIM-AS 2008/29, CARIM Analytic and Synthetic Notes. Available at: <http://cadmus.eui.eu/handle/1814/8350>.
- Chan, W. (2006). 'Re-scripting the character of Birmingham's ethnic minority population: Assets and others in the stories of a multicultural city', *Area* 38(1): 79-88.
- Cliggert, L. (2003). 'Gift remitting and alliance building in Zambian modernity: Old answers to modern problems', *American Anthropologist* 105(3): 543-552.
- Creswell, J. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*. London, UK: Sage.
- Cuban, S. (2013). *De-Skilling Migrant Women in the Global Care Industry*. Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Czarniawska, B. (2004). *Narratives in Social Science Research*. London: Sage.
- Devine, F. (2004). *Cultural Practices*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Di Bartolomeo, A., Gabrielli, G. and S. Strozza. (2015). 'The migration and integration of Moroccan and Ukrainian migrants in Italy', INTERACT Research Report 08/2015. Available at: http://cadmus.eui.eu/bitstream/handle/1814/35880/INTERACT-RR-2015_08_Italy.pdf?sequence=1.
- Dolak, G. (2006). *Anna Netrebko: The New Generation Opera Star*. Verlag.
- Dusenbery, V. and D. Tatla. (2010) *Sikh Diaspora Philanthropy in Punjab: Global Giving for Local Good*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Elliott, J. (2005). *Using Narrative in Social Research*. London: Sage.
- Eurostat. (2011). 'Demography Report 2010', Eurostat News Releases 50/2011 – 1 April 2011. Available at: <http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/2995521/5036506/3-01042011-BP-EN.PDF/9de3b492-69a9-42df-a47c-e8a28aaad261?version=1.0>.
- Faist, T. (2010). *Diaspora and Transnationalism*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

- Fivush, R. (2006). 'Scripting attachment: generalized event representations and internal working models', *Attachment and Human Development* 8(3): 283-289.
- Fresnoza-Flot, A. (2009). 'Migration status and transnational mothering: The case of Filipino migrants in France', *Global Networks* 9(2): 252-270.
- Glick Schiller, N. (2009). 'A global perspective on transnational migration: Theorizing migration without methodological nationalism', University of Oxford COMPAS Working Papers WP-09-67. https://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/fileadmin/files/Publications/working_papers/WP_2009/WP0967%20Glick%20Schiller.pdf.
- Gropas, R., A. Triandafyllidou, and L. Bartolini. (2014). 'Conceptualizing the integration-transnationalism nexus', *Global Governance Programme Papers*. Available at: http://cadmus.eui.eu/bitstream/handle/1814/33654/ITHACA_Report_Conceptualising_201412.pdf?sequence=1.
- Guarnizo, L. E., A. Portes, and W. Haller. (2003). 'Assimilation and Transnationalism: Determinants of Transnational Political Action among Contemporary Migrants', *American Journal of Sociology* 108 (6): 1211–48.
- Hagan, J., Demonsant, J.L. and S. Chavez. (2014). 'Identifying and measuring the lifelong human capital of "unskilled" migrants in the Mexico-US migratory circuit', *Journal of Migration and Human Security* 2(2): 76-100.
- Holdaway, J., Levitt, P., Fang, J. and R. Narasimhan. (2015). 'Mobility and health sector development in China and India', *Social Science and Medicine* 130: 268-276.
- Huang, S. and S. Yeoh. (2005). 'Transnational families and their children's education: China's "study mothers" in Singapore', *Global Networks* 5(4): 379-400.
- Ignatieff, M. (1994). *Blood and Belonging: Journeys Into the New Nationalism*. New York, NY: Farrar, Strauss & Giroux.
- Isaakyan, I. and A. Triandafyllidou (Forthcoming). 'Community building and soft power among Female US Expats in Greece and Italy', *Diaspora* [under review].
- Jeffries, S. (2008). 'I conquered the critics', *The Guardian* 26/08/2008. Available at: <http://www.theguardian.com/music/2008/apr/26/classicalmusicandopera.russia>.
- Kahanec, M. and M. Yuksel. (2010). 'Intergenerational transfer of human capital under post-war distress: The displaced and the Roma in the former Yugoslavia', *Discussion Paper Series IZA DP 5108*. Available at: http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1659087.
- Kaifeng, Y. and E. Bergrund. (2008). *Civic Engagement in a Network Society*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.
- Kelly, L. (2003). 'Bosnian refugees in Britain: Questioning community', *Sociology* 37(1): 35-49.

- Kivisto, P. (2001). 'Theorizing transnational immigration', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 24(4): 549-577.
- Kofman, E. (2013). 'Towards a gendered evaluation of highly skilled immigration policies in Europe', *International Migration* 52(3): 116-128.
- Lacrouix, T. (2013). 'Collective remittances and integration', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 39(6): 1019-1035.
- Lacrouix, T. (2014). 'Conceptualizing transnational engagements', *International Migration Review*: 1-37. DOI: 10.1111/imre.12105.
- Landolt, P., Autler, L., and Baires, S., (1999). 'From Hermano Lejano to Hermano Mayor: the dialectics of Salvadoran transnationalism', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22 (2): 290-315.
- Lerner, J., Rapoport, T. and E.Lomsky-Feder. (2007). 'The ethnic script in action: The re-grounding of Russian Jewish Immigrant in Israel', *Ethos* 35(2): 168-195.
- Levine, D. (2011). *The Capacity for Civic Engagement: Public and Private Worlds of the Self*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Levitt, P. (2001a). *The Transnational Villagers*. Berkley: University of California Press.
- Levitt, P. (2001b). 'Transnational migration: Taking stock and future directions', *Global Networks* 1(3): 195-216.
- Levitt, P. (2008). 'Religion as a path to civic engagement', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 31(4): 766-791.
- Levitt, P. and D. Lamba-Nieves. (2011). 'Social remittances revisited', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 37(1): 1-22.
- Ley, D. (2006). 'Explaining variations in business performance among immigrant entrepreneurs', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 32(5): 743-64.
- Ley, D. (2010). *Millionaire Migrants*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Lubkemann, S. (2005). 'The moral economy of non-return among socially diverted labour migrants from Portugal and Mozambique', in L. Trager (Ed.) *Migration and Economy: Global and Local Dynamics*. Walnut Creek: Altamira Press. Pp. 257-287.
- Marchetti, S. (2014). *Black Girls*. Leiden, NL: Brill.
- Martiniello, M. and J.-M. Lafleur. (2008). 'Towards a transatlantic dialogue in the study of immigrant political transnationalism', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 31(4): 645-663.
- Mazzucato, V. (2008). 'The Double Engagement: Transnationalism and Integration. Ghanaian Migrants' Lives between Ghana and the Netherlands', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 34 (2): 199–216.
- Mazzucato, V. (2011). 'Reverse remittances in the migration-development nexus: Two-way flows between Ghana and the Netherlands', *Population, Space and Place* 17: 454-468.
- Min Chung Yan. (2014). 'Return migrant or diaspora', *International Migration and Integration* 15: 179-196.

- Nieswand, B. (2011). *Theorising Transnational Migration: The Status Paradox of Migration*. Routledge Research in Transnationalism 22. New York: Routledge.
- Nohl, A.M., Schittenhemi, K., Schmidtke, O. and A.Weiss. (2006). 'Cultural capital during migration – a multi-level approach to the empirical analysis of labour market integration amongst highly skilled migrants', *FORUM: Qualitative Social Research* 7(3): 1-12. Available at: <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/142/313#g3>.
- Nowicka, M. (2013). 'Positioning strategies of Polish entrepreneurs in Germany: Transnationalizing Bourdieu's notion of capital', *International Sociology* 28(1): 29-47.
- Nowicka, M. (2015). 'Bourdieu's theory of practice in the study of cultural encounters and transnational transfers in migration', *MMG Working Paper Series* 15-01; SSN 2192-2357. Available at: www.mmg/mpg.de/workingpapers.
- Oke, E. (2008). 'Remittance and socio-economic conditions of Nigerian migrants in the Netherlands', *ISS Research Paper*.
- Portes, A. (1997). 'Immigration Theory for a New Century: Some Problems and Opportunities', *International Migration Review*, 799–825.
- Portes, A. (2003). 'Conclusion: Theoretical Convergencies and Empirical Evidence in the Study of Immigrant Transnationalism', *International Migration Review* 37 (3): 874–92. doi:10.1111/j.1747-7379.2003.tb00161.x.
- Portes, A., L. E. Guarnizo, and P. Landolt. (1999). 'The Study of Transnationalism: Pitfalls and Promise of an Emergent Research Field', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22 (2): 217–37. doi:10.1080/014198799329468.
- Portes, A., L. E. Guarnizo, and W. Haller. (2002). 'Transnational Entrepreneurs: An Alternative Form of Immigrant Economic Adaptation', *American Sociological Review* 67 (2): 278–98. doi:10.2307/3088896.
- Raman, A. (2010). 'Social Justice and the Migration of the Highly Skilled Elites', *Stanford Philosophy Paper Series*. URL: <http://web.stanford.edu/~aaswath/phil277.pdf>.
- Richman, K. (2005). *Migration and Vodou*. Gainesville, FL: University of Florida Press.
- Rogers, B. (2003). *Remittances and Economic Development*. Manchester, UK: University of Manchester Press.
- Sen, A. (1999). *Reason Before Identity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Siar, S. (2011). 'Skilled migration, knowledge transfer and development', *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* 30(3): 61-94.
- Stephens, D. and L. Phillips. (2005). 'Integrating Black feminist thought into conceptual frameworks of African American adolescent women's sexual scripting processes', *Sexualities, Evolution & Gender* 7(1): 37-55.
- Stiasny, M. and Gore. (2013). *Going Global*. Bingley, UK: Emerald.

- Strang, D. and S. Stroule. (1998). 'Diffusion in organizations and social movements', *Annual Review of Sociology* 24: 265-290.
- Tannen, D. (1993). 'What's in a frame? Surface evidence for underlying expectations', in D. Tannen (Ed.) *Framing in Discourse*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. pp. 14-56.
- Tilly, C. (2007). 'Trust networks in transnational migration', *Sociological Forum* 22(1): 3024.
- Tololyan, K. (2007). "The Contemporary Discourse of Diaspora Studies". *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East* 27(3): 647–855.
- Triandafyllidou, A. (2009). 'Sub-Saharan African immigrant activists in Europe: Transcultural capital and transcultural community building', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 32(1): 93-116.
- Vertovec, S. (2009). *Transnationalism*. London: Routledge.
- Weissberg, R. (2005). *The Limits of Civic Activism*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers.
- Wejnert, B. (2002). 'Integrating models of diffusion of innovations: A conceptual framework', *Annual Review of Sociology* 28: 297-326.
- Wong, J. and P. Levitt. (2014). 'Travelling faiths and migrant religions', *Global Networks* 14(3): 1-16.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (1997). *Gender and Nation*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Zelizer, V. (1996). 'Payments and social ties', *Sociological Forum* 11(3): 481-495.
- Zelizer, V. (1997). *The Social Meaning of Money*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.