

© Luuk van der Baaren, 2020

This text may be downloaded only for personal research purposes. Additional reproduction for other purposes, whether in hard copies or electronically, requires the consent of the authors. If cited or quoted, reference should be made to the full name of the author(s), editor(s), the title, the year and the publisher.

Requests should be addressed to GlobalCit@eui.eu.

Views expressed in this publication reflect the opinion of individual authors and not those of the European University Institute.

Global Citizenship Observatory (GLOBALCIT) Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies in collaboration with Edinburgh University Law School

Comparative Report Dual Citizenship in the European Union: trends and analysis (2010-2020) RSCAS/GLOBALCIT-Comp 2020/4 July 2020



© Luuk van der Baaren, 2020 Printed in Italy European University Institute Badia Fiesolana I – 50014 San Domenico di Fiesole (FI)

www.eui.eu/RSCAS/Publications/cadmus.eui.eu

Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies

The Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, created in 1992 and currently directed by Professor Brigid Laffan, aims to develop inter-disciplinary and comparative research on the major issues facing the process of European integration, European societies and Europe's place in 21st century global politics.

The Centre is home to a large post-doctoral programme and hosts major research programmes, projects and data sets, in addition to a range of working groups and *ad hoc* initiatives. The research agenda is organised around a set of core themes and is continuously evolving, reflecting the changing agenda of European integration, the expanding membership of the European Union, developments in Europe's neighbourhood and the wider world.

For more information: http://eui.eu/rscas

The EUI and the RSCAS are not responsible for the opinions expressed by the author(s).

GLOBALCIT

GLOBALCIT is the successor of EUDO CITIZENSHIP, which has been the key reference for the study of citizenship and the franchise between 2009 and 2017. With the geographic expansion of the Observatory's scope the new name reflects our worldwide coverage.

GLOBALCIT provides the most comprehensive source of information on the acquisition and loss of citizenship in Europe for policy makers, NGOs and academic researchers. Its website hosts a number of databases on domestic and international legal norms, naturalisation statistics, citizenship and electoral rights indicators, a comprehensive bibliography and glossary, a forum with scholarly debates on current citizenship trends, media news on matters of citizenship policy and various other resources for research and policy-making.

Research for the 2019 GLOBALCIT Reports has been supported by the European University Institute's <u>Global Governance Programme</u>, and the British Academy Research Project CITMODES (co-directed by the EUI and the University of Edinburgh).

The financial support from these projects is gratefully acknowledged.

For more information see: www.globalcit.eu

Abstract

This report studies the developments in 28 EU Member States of three types of dual citizenship restrictions in the period 2010-2020, namely 1) requirements to renounce the original citizenship upon the acquisition of citizenship (Globalcit modes of acquisition A05-A27), 2) provisions stipulating the loss of citizenship upon the acquisition of a foreign citizenship (Globalcit mode of loss L05), and 3) provisions stipulating the loss of citizenship upon the retention of a foreign citizenship (Globalcit mode of loss L06). The report shows that, on 1 January 2020, a majority of 16 EU Member States had none of these dual citizenship restrictions in place, while 12 other EU Member States imposed at least one of these three restrictions. However, the report also demonstrates that these 12 restrictive states have significantly mitigated dual citizenship restrictions by offering - often wide-ranging exemptions to their main rule. The report also shows that between 2010 and 2020, nine EU Member States have introduced amendments in domestic citizenship law that relate to dual citizenship. In seven of these countries, the changes amounted to an increased toleration of dual citizenship. Next to that, the report uses the concept of 'citizenship constellations' to study the interactions between dual citizenship provisions in EU Member States, concluding that a majority of 61% of citizenship constellations were permissive constellations, covering no less than 92.4% of all EU citizens who acquired the citizenship of another EU Member State in 2018. Lastly, the report proposes a number of research avenues that remain to be explored.

Keywords: Citizenship, Dual Citizenship, European Union

Comparative Report

Dual Citizenship in the European Union: trends and analysis (2010-2020)

Luuk van der Baaren¹

1. Introduction

Over the last few decades, attitudes towards dual citizenship have undergone a remarkable change. The Macimide Global Expatriate Dual Citizenship Database has shown that the share of countries where citizenship is automatically lost upon acquisition of another citizenship fell from 63% in 1960 to 24% in 2020.² The increasing tolerance of dual citizenship is also starkly illustrated by the fate of the 1963 Strasbourg Convention on the Reduction of Cases of Multiple Nationality and on Military Obligations in Cases of Multiple Nationality. At its zenith, ten states were a party to the Second Chapter of the Convention, which imposed restrictions on dual citizenship between the signatory states. By 2020, only Austria and the Netherlands have remained.³ An extensive academic debate has unfolded on the drivers of the shift towards acceptance of dual citizenship, including but not limited to the indirect effects of gender equality, migratory movements, the prevalence of remittances and diasporic political pressure as well as international policy diffusion.⁴

¹ Luuk van der Baaren is a postdoctoral researcher at the Globalcit Observatory, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, European University Institute. He obtained his PhD degrees in Law from the University of Liège and Maastricht University. The author thanks Prof. Dr. Maarten Vink and Prof. Dr. Rainer Bauböck for their valuable feedback on an earlier draft of this report.

² Vink, M., De Groot, G.R., Luk, N.C., MACIMIDE Global Expatriate Dual Citizenship Dataset, Harvard Dataverse, version 5, 2020, via <

https://dataverse.harvard.edu/dataset.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/TTMZ08>, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

³ https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list/-/conventions/treaty/043/signatures, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

⁴ Alarian, H. and Wallace Goodman, S., 'Dual citizenship allowance and migration flow: an origin story', *Comparative Political Studies*, Vol. 50 No. 1, 2017; Faist, T., Gerdes, J. and Rieple, B., 'Dual Citizenship as a Path-Dependent Process', *International Migration Review*, Vol. 38, No. 3, 2004; Faist, T., 'The fixed and porous boundaries of dual citizenship', in: Faist, T., *Dual citizenship in Europe: From nationhood to societal integration*, Farnham: Ashgate Publishing, 2007; Leblang, D. et al., 'Harnessing the diaspora: dual citizenship, migrant return remittances', *Comparative Political Studies*, Vol. 50 No. 1, 2017.; Martin, D., 'The trend towards dual nationality', in: Martin, D. and Hailbronner, K. (eds.), *Rights and duties of dual nationals*, The Hague: Kluwer, 2003; Mirilovic, N., 'Regime type, international migration, and the politics of dual citizenship toleration', *International Political Science Review*, Vol. 36, No. 5, 2014; Vink, M., and De Groot, G.R., 'Citizenship attribution in Western Europe: International framework and domestic trends', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 36 No. 5, 2010; Vink, M., Prokic-Breuer, T., and Dronkers, J., 'Immigrant naturalisation in the context of institutional diversity: policy matters, but to whom?', *International Migration*, Vol. 51 No. 5, 2013; Vink, M., Schakel, A., Reichel, D., Luk, C., De Groot, G.R., 'The international diffusion of expatriate dual citizenship', *Migration Studies*, Vol. 7 No. 3, 2019.

This report aims to clarify the current state of affairs regarding dual citizenship in 28 Member States of the European Union.⁵ Firstly, the variations of dual citizenship regimes within the EU-28 will be outlined, including the interactions of these regimes in 'citizenship constellations'. Secondly, developments regarding dual citizenship policies in the EU-28 between 1 January 2010 and 1 January 2020 will be discussed, as well as relevant developments regarding citizenship of the European Union. Throughout this report, the typology of the GLOBALCIT Modes of Acquisition and Loss of Citizenship Database will be used.⁶

1.1 Varieties of restrictions to dual citizenship in the European Union

Restrictions of dual citizenship in the European Union can be divided into three categories, namely 1) requirements to renounce the original citizenship upon the acquisition of citizenship (Globalcit modes of acquisition A05-A27), 2) provisions stipulating the (automatic or notautomatic) loss of citizenship upon the acquisition of a foreign citizenship (Globalcit mode of loss L05), and 3) provisions stipulating the (automatic or non-automatic) loss of citizenship upon the retention of a foreign citizenship (Globalcit mode of loss L06). In addition to that, a small number of countries outside the European Union restrict acquisition of citizenship at birth if the child has already obtained another citizenship at birth, but this is not the case in any of the EU Member States. ⁷ It must be noted that, in the context of the European Union, the concept of EU citizenship is of paramount importance. On the basis of Art. 9 TEU and Art. 20 TFEU, persons holding the citizenship of an EU Member State are also citizens of the European Union and therefore enjoy a 'bundle of rights' in all EU Member States. EU citizenship status springs from national citizenship, the demarcation of which has in principle remained a member state competence. Nevertheless, the European Court of Justice ruled in Micheletti that it is for each Member State, having due regard to EU law, to determine its citizenry and, consequentially, the citizenry of the European Union. 9 As this report focuses on domestic citizenship law, the concept of EU citizenship will play a limited role in this report.

⁵ On 1 January 2020, the following 28 countries were EU Member States: Austria, Belgium, Bulgaria, Croatia, Republic of Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Ireland, Italy, Latvia, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, Netherlands, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden and the United Kingdom.

⁶ See: https://globalcit.eu/acquisition-citizenship/>, last accessed on 20 June 2020; Vink, M. and Van der Baaren, L., GLOBALCIT Modes of Acquisition and Loss of Citizenship Dataset Codebook, Version 1.00, Globalcit, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute (forthcoming).

⁷ Examples are China, where a child born abroad of Chinese citizen parents who have settled abroad does not automatically acquire Chinese citizenship if he or she also acquires a foreign nationality at birth (Art. 5 Nationality Law of the People's Republic of China) and Panama, where a child born abroad of Panamanian citizen parents can only acquire citizenship if he or she takes up residence in the country (Art. 13 Political Constitution of the Republic of Panama).

⁸ See *inter alia*: Bauböck, R. (ed), *Debating European Citizenship*, Cham: Springer International Publishing 2019; De Groot, G. R. and Luk, N. C., Twenty years of CJEU jurisprudence on citizenship, *German Law Journal*, Vol.15, No. 5, 2014; Guild, E., *The Legal Elements of European Identity: EU Citizenship and Migration Law*, The Hague: Kluwer Law International 2004; Kochenov, D. (ed), *EU Citizenship and Federalism*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 2017; Maas, W. (ed), *Multilevel Citizenship*, Philadelpia: University of Pennsylvania Press 2013; Margiotta, C., Vonk, O., "Nationality law and European citizenship: the role of dual nationality", in: Talani, L.S. (ed), *Globalisation, Migration, and the Future of Europe: Insiders and Outsiders*, London: Routledge Press 2012.

⁹ Case C-369/90, *Micheletti and others v Delegación del Gobierno en Cantabria*, ECLI:EU:C:1992:295 (Micheletti), par. 10; H. U. Jessurun d'Oliveira, Case C-369/90, MV Micheletti and others v. Delegacion del Gobierno en Cantabria, Judgment of 7 July 1992, *Common Market Law Review*, Vol. 30, 1993. . See also: Case

1.1.1 Requirement to renounce the original citizenship upon the acquisition of citizenship (Globalcit modes of acquisition A05-A27)

From a receiving state perspective, countries can restrict dual citizenship by compelling a person to renounce his or her original citizenship upon acquisition of citizenship. This often requires explicit renunciation of the original citizenship, which can usually be achieved by making a declaration. In a number of states, citizens can only be released from their citizenship with the prior approval of the public authorities. Next to that, additional conditions can apply, for example that military service must have been completed prior to the renunciation of citizenship.

The practical ramifications of a renunciation requirement depend on the citizenship law of the origin state, and the receiving state's interpretation thereof. Firstly, if the original citizenship is automatically lost upon the acquisition of another citizenship, the requirement to renounce the original citizenship might be considered redundant. Conversely, a number of countries still adhere to the doctrine of perpetual allegiance, meaning that the citizenship of the origin country cannot be renounced at all. In addition to that, the renunciation of the original citizenship cannot be reasonably required in certain cases, for example if renunciation is excessively costly or if it would lead to the loss of property rights in the origin state. In such cases, persons are commonly exempted from the renunciation requirement, as stipulated by Art. 16 of the European Convention on Nationality. As the precise conditions for these exceptions are often complex and can usually only be retrieved from subsidiary legislation or administrative guidelines, these will not be further discussed in the analysis.

1.1.2 Loss of citizenship upon the acquisition of a foreign citizenship (L05)

From a sending state perspective, countries can restrict dual citizenship by revoking citizenship of a citizen who acquires a foreign citizenship. The revocation of citizenship either takes place automatically when another citizenship is acquired or can alternatively be withdrawn, meaning that an act of the public authorities is required in order to initiate the loss of citizenship.

1.1.3 Loss of citizenship upon retention of a foreign citizenship (L06)

Dual citizenship regularly arises during childhood, for example if parents transmit more than one citizenship *iure sanguinis*, if citizenship is acquired *iure sanguinis* as well as *iure soli*. In countries where dual citizenship is restricted, persons can therefore be required to renounce their other citizenship(s) before attaining a certain age, as they might otherwise lose their citizenship.

In Table 1, an overview is provided of the above-mentioned modes of acquisition and loss in 28 EU Member States for the reference date of 1 January 2020. The data is drawn from

C-192/99, *Kaur*, par. 19; Case C-200/02, *Zhu and Chen*, par. 37; Case C-135/08, Case C-34/09, *Zambrano*, par. 42. Rottmann, par. 59; Case C-221/17, *Tjebbes*, par. 48.

¹⁰ For an overview of countries where this is the case, see: Vink, M. et al., (n 2).

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² On 1 January 2020, the European Convention on Nationality had been signed and ratified by 13 EU Member States (Austria, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, Germany, Hungary, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Portugal, Slovak Republic and Sweden), albeit in certain cases with reservations. See:

https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list/-/conventions/treaty/166/signatures?p auth=ORav5mQp>, last accessed on 20 June 2020. For a further analysis, see: De Groot, G.R., The European Convention on Nationality: a step towards a ius commune in the field of nationality law, *Maastricht journal of European and comparative law*, Vol. 7, No. 2, 2000.

the update for 2020 of the GLOBALCIT Global Database on Modes of Acquisition of Citizenship. 13 If the necessary data could not be derived from this dataset, domestic citizenship legislation of that particular state was assessed, which is referred to in a footnote. The overview mainly focuses on dual citizenship provisions for ordinary residence-based naturalisation (A06) and exceptions to the main rule for this mode are briefly summarised. In addition to that, other modes of acquisition of citizenship not related to acquisition at birth (A05, A07-A27) are also included in order to provide a comprehensive overview. If acquisition of citizenship under any of these particular modes requires renunciation of the original citizenship, this is marked as 'Renunciation' or 'Renunciation - exceptions'. A more detailed overview of applicable exceptions will be provided in Section 3. If no renunciation is required for acquisition of citizenship under a particular mode, this is marked as 'No renunciation'. If a mode of acquisition is not in place in a state, this is marked as 'n.a.'. For loss provisions, the provisions are marked as 'Loss', 'No loss' or 'n.a.'. If a provision is only applicable to a particular subcategory of citizens (e.g. only to citizens by naturalisation), this is stated in the overview table, as the notification in the overview table could otherwise be regarded as deceptive. The data is derived from the 2020 update for the Globalcit modes of acquisition and loss of citizenship database.

1.2 Dual citizenship in the European Union: Analysis of national legal provisions

In 16 EU Member States (Belgium, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, France, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Luxembourg, Malta, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Sweden and the United Kingdom), there are no restrictions in place on dual citizenship for foreign nationals who acquire the citizenship of the country or citizens who acquire the citizenship of a foreign country. As these Member States constitute a majority, this again underlines that toleration of dual citizenship is steadfastly becoming the norm within the European Union.

In seven EU Member States (Austria, Estonia, Germany, Latvia, Lithuania, the Netherlands and Spain), restrictions on dual citizenship are in place for both persons who acquire the citizenship of the country as well as citizens of the country who acquire the citizenship of a foreign country. In five other EU Member States, dual citizenship is restricted asymmetrically. In Bulgaria, Croatia and Slovenia, dual citizenship is restricted for those who acquire citizenship, but not for citizens who acquire a foreign citizenship. In Ireland and Slovakia, restrictions on dual citizenship are in place for citizens who acquire a foreign citizenship, but not for those who acquire citizenship.

1.2.1 Requirement to renounce the original citizenship upon the acquisition of citizenship (Globalcit modes of acquisition A05-A27)

In ten EU Member States (Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Estonia, Germany, Latvia, Lithuania, the Netherlands, Slovenia and Spain), acquiring citizenship through residence-based naturalisation (A06) requires that the original citizenship of the applicant is either expressly renounced or that the original citizenship was lost in an alternative way (e.g. through automatic loss).

It is important to note that the renunciation requirement is in many EU Member States not consistently applied to all modes of acquisition of citizenship. Seven restrictive Member

¹³ Global Database on Modes of Acquisition of Citizenship, Globalcit, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute, via http://globalcit.eu/acquisition-citizenship/, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

States (Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Germany, Lithuania, the Netherlands and Spain) have distinct provisions for the acquisition of citizenship by a spouse or partner of a citizen (A08), of which four (Bulgaria, Croatia, the Netherlands and Spain) do not require that the spouse or partner renounces his or her original citizenship. Out of the four restrictive Member States (Austria, Bulgaria, Germany, Latvia and Spain) that have a special provision for citizens of particular states (A18), all states except Austria exempt these groups from the renunciation requirement. In Germany, citizens of an EU Member State or Switzerland are exempted from the renunciation requirement. This also the case in Bulgaria and Latvia, although Latvia additionally exempts citizens from NATO Member States, as well as Australia, Brazil and New Zealand. Spain exempts citizens of Ibero-American countries, Andorra, the Philippines, Equatorial Guinea and Portugal. Seven restrictive states have a distinct provision for the acquisition of citizenship by recognised refugees, and all of these states exempt this group from the renunciation requirement. Lastly, nine restrictive Member States have a distinct provision for naturalisation on the basis of extraordinary achievements (A24), all of which except the Netherlands exempt these persons from the renunciation requirement. For Austria, Bulgaria and Slovenia, this is also the case for persons who acquire citizenship on the basis of economic contributions (A26). In five restrictive Member States (Bulgaria, Croatia, Germany, Lithuania and Spain), special provisions are in place for persons who are considered to be culturally affiliated to the respective country (A19). In all cases, these persons are exempted from the renunciation requirement. All in all, this overview illustrates that countries that seemingly take a restrictive stance on dual citizenship provide numerous exceptions to this main rule.

1.2.2 Loss of citizenship upon the acquisition of a foreign citizenship (L05)

In nine EU Member States (Austria, Estonia, Germany, Ireland, Latvia, Lithuania, the Netherlands, Slovakia and Spain), the acquisition of a foreign citizenship can result in the loss of citizenship. Only in Slovakia is this provision absolute. The other eight states provide exceptions to their main rule. These exceptions are most extensive in Estonia and Ireland, as Estonian citizens by birth are constitutionally protected from involuntary loss of citizenship, which means that the loss provision is only applicable to a minority of Estonian citizens. ¹⁴ The Irish loss provision is only applicable to citizens by naturalisation. In Germany, Latvia and Spain, citizens who obtain the citizenship of certain states are exempted from the loss provision. Germany provides an exemption for citizens who acquire the citizenship of an EU Member State or Switzerland, while Latvia also exempts citizens from EEA- and NATO Member States, as well as Australia, Brazil and New Zealand. Spain exempts citizens who acquire or retain the citizenship of Ibero-American countries, Andorra, the Philippines, Equatorial Guinea and Portugal. Importantly, the loss of Spanish citizenship can only occur if a Spanish citizen has resided abroad for a period of at least three years, and the loss of citizenship can be prevented by making a declaration within that period. In the Netherlands, a person who resides in the country where he or she was born and obtains the citizenship of that particular country is exempted from the loss of Dutch citizenship. This is also the case for a person who obtains citizenship of a country where he or she has resided for a period of at least five years during minority and for a person who acquires the citizenship that his or her spouse holds. The exceptions are not applicable to Dutch citizens who obtain Austrian citizenship, as both the Netherlands and Austria are (the last remaining) parties of the Second Chapter of the 1963 Strasbourg Convention Reduction of Cases of Multiple Nationality and Austria has not ratified

¹⁴ Art. 8 Constitution of the Republic of Estonia 1992.

the Second Protocol of the Convention.¹⁵ Lastly, in Austria, Germany, Latvia and Lithuania, permission can be obtained for the retention of citizenship upon the acquisition of a foreign citizenship. In Lithuania and Latvia, such permission can be obtained in incidental cases by persons of 'outstanding merits' (Lithuania)¹⁶ or due to 'important state interests' (Latvia)¹⁷. In Austria, retention of Austrian citizenship must be in the interest of the Republic of Austria due to the person's actual or expected achievements or other grounds deserving of consideration. Additionally, Austrian citizens by birth may be granted exceptional permission to retain their citizenship on grounds related to their private and family life.¹⁸ In Germany, the grant of a 'retention permit' (*Beibehaltungsgenehmigung*) depends on a balance of public and private interests, while citizens who reside abroad must also prove that they have retained sufficient ties to Germany.¹⁹

1.2.3 Loss of citizenship upon the retention of a foreign citizenship (L06)

Only in three Member States (Germany, Latvia and Lithuania), citizenship can be lost by a person who acquired a foreign citizenship during minority (e.g. at birth) and subsequently retained that citizenship after reaching a certain age. In Germany, a person who acquired citizenship due to birth in Germany and also acquired another citizenship during minority (e.g. iure sanguinis) is required to renounce the foreign citizenship upon attaining the age of 21 years. Failure to fulfil this requirement after a period of two years from the date of notification will result in the automatic loss of German citizenship. However, those who grew up in Germany are exempted from the loss provision. A person is exempted if he or she has resided in Germany for at least eight years before turning 21, or attended a German school for at least six years, or graduated from a German school or a German education institution. German citizens who also hold a citizenship of another EU Member State or Switzerland are also exempted from the loss provision. Finally, a person who does not fulfil any of these criteria can still be permitted to retain German citizenship if the loss of citizenship would constitute 'particular hardship', which is assessed on a case-by-case basis. In addition to that, a person only loses German citizenship if he or she has not been expressly notified of this option duty by the authorities before attaining the age of 21 years. In Latvia, citizens who acquired another citizenship during minority are required to either renounce their other citizenship or submit a request for renunciation of Latvian citizenship before attaining the age of 25 years. If a person does not fulfil this requirement, he or she can be deprived of Latvian citizenship. Latvian citizens who also hold citizenship of an EU-, EEA- or NATO Member State or Australia, Brazil or New Zealand are exempted from this provision. In addition to that, Latvian citizens who hold another citizenship due to adoption or marriage or who obtained permission for retention of citizenship due to important national interests are also exempted from this provision. In Lithuania, the requirement to renounce a foreign citizenship before age 21 is not applicable to Lithuanian citizens who also acquired another citizenship at birth, which means that only a minority of Lithuanian citizens are covered by this provision (e.g. citizens by adoption).

 $^{^{15} \, \}underline{\text{https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list/-/conventions/treaty/043/signatures?p_auth=ORav5mQp} \,, \, last accessed on 20 \, June 2020.$

¹⁶ Art. 7 par. 7 Lithuanian Citizenship Act 2010.

¹⁷ Art. par. 1 sub 5 Latvian Citizenship Act 1995.

¹⁸ Art. 28 par. 2 Austrian Citizenship Law 1985.

¹⁹ Art. 25 par. 2 German Citizenship Act 1913.

2. Citizenship constellations

So far, this report has analysed national restrictions of dual citizenship taken separately. However, dual citizenship can only occur if two states concurrently permit dual citizenship. Therefore, provisions related to dual citizenship should be studied in cohesion, or as 'citizenship constellations'. The term 'citizenship constellations' was coined by Bauböck and aims to "[...] [bring] into view how host and home countries create a web of legal and political ties with migrant and ethnic kin groups that also affects intergovernmental relations and public policy reform in each country".²⁰

The concept of citizenship constellations will be applied in this report in order to outline the extent of dual citizenship acceptance in the European Union. Although the concept has a broader connotation, it will be used here in a narrow sense, focusing on the interactions between legal provisions in receiving countries and sending countries that potentially restrict dual citizenship. More precisely, the interactions between provisions requiring the renunciation of the original citizenship upon acquisition of citizenship (A05-A27) and provisions imposing the (automatic or non-automatic) loss of original citizenship upon acquisition of another citizenship (L05) will be studied for the 28 EU Member States. Thereby, it will be elucidated whether both the receiving country and the sending country in a particular citizenship constellation allow for the occurrence of dual citizenship. One could argue that studying the acquisition of dual citizenship among EU Member States is a needless exercise, as the status of EU citizenship already grants a 'bundle of rights' across all Member States (see Section 2). However, as will be shown below, the number of EU citizens acquiring citizenship of another Member State is far from negligible, and therefore deserves special attention.

In Table 2, each cell depicts whether a state (referred to in column) requires the renunciation of origin citizenship upon acquisition of citizenship and whether a state (referred to in row) imposes the loss of original citizenship upon acquisition of another citizenship on the reference date of 31 December 2018. If the renunciation of the original citizenship is not required in *any* case for that particular constellation and if the loss of citizenship upon acquisition of another citizenship is also not imposed in *any* case for that particular constellation, the cell is marked grey. In all other cases, the cell is unmarked. An important *caveat* is that many important nuances of dual citizenship restrictions cannot be taken into account in this manner. For example, certain states (e.g. the Netherlands and Spain) do not restrict dual citizenship for all relevant modes of acquisition of citizenship (A05-A27), but only for some of these modes. Other states (e.g. Austria) in principle restrict dual citizenship, yet permission can be granted for the retention of citizenship in individual cases. Therefore, if a cell has remained unmarked, this merely indicates that dual citizenship is *potentially* restricted for a particular constellation.

In order to also depict the numerical significance of each citizenship constellation, the number of persons who acquired citizenship in the reference year of 2018 is depicted for each particular constellation on the basis of data provided by Eurostat on the acquisition of citizenship.²¹ Another *caveat* is necessary here, as it has remained unclear which data citizenship acquisitions is provided to Eurostat by EU Member States, as the data requirements

²⁰ Bauböck, R., "Studying citizenship constellations", *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, Vol. 36, No. 5, 2010, p. 849.

²¹ European Commission, "Acquisition of citizenship (2018)" [data file], Eurostat, 2020, via <eurostat.ec.europa.eu>.

as stipulated in an EC Regulation can be considered ambiguous.²² Therefore, it cannot be excluded that the figures as depicted in Table 2 do not capture all persons who acquired citizenship in a particular EU Member State on the basis of modes A05-A27 in 2018.

In total, the approach results in 756 possible citizenship constellations. Of these 756 constellations, 461 constellations (61%) do not restrict dual citizenship in any case. The 756 constellations covered the acquisition of citizenship of 153,317 persons for the reference year of 2018, or more than one fifth of the 672,300 citizenship acquisitions of EU citizens and non-EU citizens combined. Of these 153,317 persons, 141,669 (92.4%) were covered by a non-restrictive citizenship constellation, meaning that dual citizenship was not restricted in any case. This shows that the majority of EU Member States mutually tolerates the occurrence of dual citizenship and that the abundant majority of EU citizens who acquired the citizenship of another member state was able to retain his or her original citizenship.

In virtually all permissive states, the share of persons who acquired citizenship while being able to retain an original citizenship exceeds 90%. The single exception is the Czech Republic, where only 35.7% of persons who acquired Czech citizenship was able to do so. This is mostly caused by the relatively large number of Slovak citizens who acquired Czech citizenship in 2018 (346 out of 543 persons in total). While the Czech Republic does not restrict dual citizenship, Slovak citizenship is automatically lost upon the acquisition of a foreign citizenship (see Section 3).

It is likely that a share of the persons covered by a potentially restrictive constellation in the EU-28 (11,648 persons out of 153,317 persons, or 11.6%) was still able to retain the original citizenship. As stated earlier, many important exceptions to the restrictive provisions could not be taken into account in this analysis. For example, in the Netherlands, national statistics show that the majority of EU citizens who acquired Dutch citizenship in 2018 did so on the basis of an option right.²³ For seven out of eight option rights, the renunciation of the original citizenship is not required.²⁴

It is also clear that Brexit had a substantial impact on intra-EU citizenship acquisitions, as 47,584 EU citizens acquired British citizenship in 2018, while 16,193 British citizens acquired another EU citizenship in the same year, which covers more than one third of all EU citizens who acquired another EU citizenship. Out of the 47,584 EU citizens who acquired British citizenship, 46,228 (97.2%) were covered by a permissive citizenship constellation. Out of 16,193 British citizens who acquired another EU citizenship, 14,835 persons (91.6%) were covered by such a permissive constellation. This shows that a large majority of EU citizens have been able to mitigate the personal consequences of Brexit by obtaining or retaining an EU citizenship, next to British citizenship.

All in all, applying the concept of citizenship constellations on intra-EU acquisition of citizenship clearly shows the pervasiveness of dual citizenship tolerance within the European Union. It also shows that an abundant majority of EU citizens who acquired the citizenship of another EU Member State most likely became dual citizens. However, the overrepresentation of persons covered by a permissive citizenship constellation could also indicate that restrictions

²² EU Member States are required to provide statistical data on "persons having their usual residence in the territory of the Member State and having acquired during the reference year the citizenship of the Member State and having formerly held the citizenship of another Member State or a foreign or having formerly been stateless, disaggregated by age and sex, and by the former citizenship of the persons concerned and by whether the person was formerly stateless" (Art. 3 par. 1 sub d Regulation (EC) No. 862/2007).

²³ CBS, Nationaliteitswijzigingen; geslacht, nationaliteit en regeling (2018) [data file], 2020, via https://www.cbs.nl>, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

²⁴ Art. 6A Kingdom Act on Dutch Nationality 1985.

on dual citizenship impede persons from acquiring another EU citizenship. This possibility can be further assessed on the basis of the naturalisation rate, defined as the ratio between the number of persons who acquired the citizenship of a country during a calendar year and the stock of foreign residents in the same country at the beginning of the year.²⁵ An overview of the naturalisation rates of citizens of EU Member States in the United Kingdom as well as British citizens in EU Member States is depicted in Table 3. The overview indicates that naturalisation rates are indeed lower for citizens of restrictive states. For EU citizens who acquired British citizenship, the naturalisation rate for permissive constellations is 1.54%, while the naturalisation rate for restrictive constellations is 0.55%. For British citizens who acquired another EU citizenship, the naturalisation rate for permissive constellations is 2.94%, while the rate for restrictive constellations is 0.39%.

It must be noted that naturalisation rates are an imperfect tool of measurement in this regard, in particular due to data discrepancies.²⁶ Nevertheless, the vast difference between the naturalisation rates for permissive constellations and restrictive constellations could indicate that restrictions on dual citizenship indeed deter third-country citizens from acquiring citizenship – a finding that would resonate with earlier studies on this topic.²⁷ The practical consequences of dual citizenship restrictions therefore deserve to be a topic of further scholarly attention.

3. Developments regarding dual citizenship in EU Member States (2010-2020)

Austria

On 11 December 2018, the Austrian Constitutional Court delivered a judgment considering Austrian-Turkish dual citizens. Through a leaked extract of the Turkish electoral register, the Austrian authorities had learned that a number of Austrian citizens of Turkish descent had retained or reacquired Turkish citizenship and consequentially had lost Austrian citizenship, which the affected persons contested in court.²⁸ The Constitutional Court granted the appeal on procedural grounds, as it ruled that the above-mentioned extract of the Turkish electoral register could not be regarded as legal evidence and that the burden of proof in this regard rests on the Austrian authorities.²⁹ This once again underlines that it can be difficult for states to enforce restrictive provisions regarding dual citizenship as long as states do not exchange information in this regard.

Austrian citizenship law has traditionally held a negative attitude towards dual citizenship for emigrants as well as immigrants, but also provides for a small number of

²⁵ European Commission, "Glossary: Naturalisation Rate", Eurostat, 2014, via: https://ec.europa.eu/>, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

²⁶ European Commission, "Acquisition and loss of citizenship (migr_acqn)", Eurostat Metadata File, Eurostat, 2020, via: via: https://ec.europa.eu/>, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

²⁷ See: Alarian, H., and Wallace Goodman, S., "Dual citizenship allowance and migration flow: an origin story", *Comparative Political Studies*, Vol. 50 No. 1, 2017, pp. 133-167.

²⁸ Case E 3717/2018-42, Constitutional Court, 11 December 2018, paras. 1-14.

²⁹ Ibid., paras. 57-78.

exceptions in this regard.³⁰ One of these exceptions is a procedure for reacquisition of citizenship by registration for Austrian citizens who were forced to leave Austria before 9 May 1945 due to (a fear of) persecution by the German Nationalist Socialist Working Party or the regime of the Third Reich.³¹ This group is exempted from the requirement to renounce an original citizenship upon acquisition of Austrian citizenship.³² On 20 September 2020, an amendment came into force that extended the above-mentioned date limit to 15 May 1955 and broadened the scope of the provision, now also including persons who were exiled from Austria due to their support for a democratic Austria as well citizens of other states of the former Austrian-Hungarian Empire who were residing in Austria before their exile.³³ Most importantly, the provision was extended to direct descendants of those who were eligible for reacquisition of Austrian citizenship on the basis of this provision, also without requiring the renunciation of the original citizenship.³⁴

Bulgaria

Bulgaria's approach towards dual citizenship can be regarded as asymmetrical. A Bulgarian citizen who acquires a foreign citizenship does not lose Bulgarian citizenship, whereas foreign citizens who acquire Bulgarian citizenship through ordinary naturalisation are required to renounce their original citizenship (Art. 12 para. 1 sub 6 Bulgarian Citizenship Act). In 2013, several exception grounds were introduced to this renunciation requirement. This entailed that spouses of Bulgarian citizens, citizens of an EU- or EEA Member State or Switzerland as well as citizens of countries that Bulgaria has concluded bilateral agreements with were no longer required to renounce their original citizenship (Art. 12 para. 2 Bulgarian Citizenship Act).³⁵ In addition to that, persons who acquired a Bulgarian residence permit by investment and subsequently applied for naturalisation were exempted from the renunciation requirement and could therefore retain their original citizenship upon naturalisation.³⁶

Czech Republic

Czech Republic traditionally held a negative attitude towards dual citizenship. Since the introduction of the Czech Citizenship Act in 1993, applicants for naturalisation were in principle required to renounce their original citizenship, while Czech citizens automatically lost their citizenship upon voluntary acquisition of a foreign citizenship.³⁷ Although the prohibition of dual citizenship was initially nearly absolute, several mitigating provisions for particular groups were introduced thereafter, which made the country's negative stance on dual citizenship increasingly untenable.³⁸ In 2013, the Czech Republic came to accept dual citizenship, as the existing citizenship law was replaced by Act 186/2013 and the above-

³³ Citizenship Amendment Act, Federal Law Gazette [Bundesgesetzblatt], 22 October 2019.

³⁰ See for an historical overview of Austrian citizenship law: Stern, J., Valchars, G., Country Report: Austria, San Domenico di Fiesole: Globalcit Observatory, 2013, p. 4 ff.

³¹ Art. 10 par. 4 sub 2 Austrian Citizenship Act 1985.

³² Ibid.

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ Law to amend and supplement the Law on Bulgarian citizenship, state Gazette [Държавен Вестник], No. 108, 17 December 2013.

³⁶ Law to amend and supplement the Law on Bulgarian citizenship, state Gazette [Държавен Вестник], No. 16, 19 February 2013.

³⁷ Art. 7 par. 1(b) and Art. 17 Act No. 40/1992 on the Acquisition and Loss of Citizenship of the Czech Republic, via https://www.refworld.org.

³⁸ Baršová, A., *Country Report: Czech Republic*, San Domenico di Fiesole: EUDO Citizenship Observatory 2014, p. 23.

mentioned loss provisions were abolished.³⁹ A novel provision was introduced in order to allow those who had lost Czech or Czechoslovak citizenship before the introduction of Act 186/2013 to reacquire their citizenship by declaration, although several categories of former citizens are excluded from this provision.⁴⁰ In 2019, the provision was extended to children and grandchildren of former Czech or Czechoslovak citizens.⁴¹

Denmark

Denmark has traditionally been intolerant towards dual citizenship. In 2011, a centre-left coalition came to power and announced that it intended to make Danish citizenship law less restrictive. Permitting dual citizenship was considered to be in line with that goal. Surprisingly, the right-wing Danish People's Party, which had strongly opposed dual citizenship in the past, also came to support the toleration of dual citizenship as it would enable the revocation of citizenship from those who engage in or support terrorism. 43

In 2014, an amending law to the Danish Citizenship Act was approved by the Danish Parliament, which subsequently came into force on 1 September 2015.⁴⁴ The amending law abrogated several restricting provisions, namely a provision that required the renunciation of a foreign citizenship upon voluntary acquisition of Danish citizenship (Art. 4A Danish Citizenship Act), a provision on the automatic loss of Danish citizenship upon the voluntary acquisition of a foreign citizenship or entering public service abroad (Art. 7(i)(ii) Danish Citizenship Act), and provisions restricting dual citizenship for minors (Art. 5 par. 2 and Art. 7(iii) Danish Citizenship Act). Those who had lost Danish citizenship on the basis of the loss provisions in Art. 7 were enabled to reacquire Danish citizenship law by declaration between 1 September 2015 and 31 August 2020, except for those who had been unconditionally convicted to a custodial sentence during the period between the loss of Danish citizenship and the moment of making the declaration (Art. 3 Law No. 1497 of 23 December 2014).

Estonia

According to Art. 29 of the Estonian Citizenship, an Estonian national who acquires another citizenship is deemed to have ceased to be an Estonian citizen. A person who wishes to acquire Estonian citizenship by naturalisation is in principle required to provide a written confirmation that he or she has been released from his or her previous citizenship or will be released therefrom (Art. 19 par. 3 Citizenship Act). Estonian citizens who acquired another citizenship at birth are required to renounce one of their nationalities within three years after attaining the age of majority (Art. 3 Citizenship Act). Nevertheless, Art. 8 of the Estonian Constitution provides that Estonians citizens by birth cannot be deprived of their Estonian citizenship. Although it is clear that Estonian citizens by naturalisation are not permitted to hold more than one citizenship, it remains unclear whether this is also the case for citizens by birth who acquire

³⁹ Act No. 186/2013 on Citizenship of the Czech Republic and on the amendment of selected other laws (the Czech Citizenship Act), via https://www.globalcit.eu.

⁴⁰ Art. 31 Czech Citizenship Act.

⁴¹ Act. No. 207/2019, amending Act No. 186/2013 On Citizenship of the Czech Republic and on Amendments to Certain Acts (Act on Citizenship of the Czech Republic), via https://www.globalcit.eu>.

⁴² Ersbøll, E., *Report on citizenship law: Denmark*, San Domenico di Fiesole: EUDO Citizenship Observatory 2015, p. 29.

⁴³ Midtbøen, A.H., Roland Birkvad, S. and Bivand Erdal, M., Citizenship in the Nordic Countries: Past, Present Future, Temanord 2018, p. 35.

⁴⁴ Law No. 1497 of 23 December 2014 amending the law on Danish citizenship, via https://www.globalcit.eu.

another citizenship.⁴⁵ It has been asserted that dual citizenship is *de facto* tolerated for citizens by birth, as the constitutional provisions should overrule the contradictory provisions in the Citizenship Act.⁴⁶ The most recent attempt to clarify this matter took place in 2018, when the Estonian Reform Party submitted a draft bill in order to amend the Estonian Citizenship Act.⁴⁷ It proposed that dual citizenship would be expressly allowed for all Estonian citizens with certain countries, namely EU- and EEA Member States, Switzerland, the United states, Australia, Canada, New Zealand or a state with which a bilateral agreement had been concluded. The bill was eventually rejected.⁴⁸

Germany

Germany has traditionally held a negative attitude towards dual citizenship for both emigrants and immigrants.⁴⁹ In December 2014, this negative stance was mitigated, as amendments related to the German 'option duty' came into force. 50 The option duty requires persons born of non-German citizen parents who acquired German citizenship iure soli and who also acquired another citizenship during their minority (e.g. at birth) to renounce their other citizenship upon attaining 21 years (Art. 29 para. 1 German Citizenship Law). The option duty - taken together with other restrictive measures - left a significant share of second- or third generation immigrants without German citizenship.⁵¹ The option duty has therefore been a highly controversial feature of German citizenship law, sparking an academic debate on the role of citizenship law in a multicultural society.⁵² According to the amended provision, those who had resided in Germany for at least eight years before attaining 21 years, or attended a German school for at least six years, or graduated from a German school or a professional German education institution were now exempted from the option duty (Art. 29 para. 1 sub 2 German Citizenship Law). Therefore, a person who demonstrably grew up in Germany could retain a foreign citizenship, next to German citizenship. If a person does not fulfil any of the above-mentioned criteria, he or she can still be permitted to retain German citizenship if the loss of citizenship would constitute a 'particular hardship', which is assessed on a case-by-case basis (Art. 29 para. 4 German Citizenship Law). Lastly, as is also the case for other categories of German dual citizens, those who hold a citizenship of the European Union or Switzerland are exempted from the option duty altogether (Art. 29 para. 1 sub 3 German Citizenship Law).

⁴⁵ Järve, P., Poleshchuk, V., Country Report: Estonia, EUDO Citizenship Observatory, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute, 2013, p. 10.

⁴⁶ Pajumets, M., Pathways to citizenship for third-country nationals in the EU Member States: Estonian National Report, Tallinn: European Migration Network Estonia, p. 8.

⁴⁷ Citizenship Act Amendment Act 634 SE, 9 May 2018, via https://m.riigikogu.ee.

⁴⁸ https://m.riigikogu.ee/tegevus/eelnoud/eelnou/ebd93883-0cb9-4d1d-b58f-9e6aab9f24d1/, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

⁴⁹ See for an historical overview of German citizenship law: Farahat, A., Hailbronner, K., *Report on citizenship law: Germany*, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute 2020, p. 2 ff.

⁵⁰ Second Law on the Amending of the Citizenship Law, Federal Law Gazette [*Bundesgesetzblatt*], No. 52, 20 November 2014, p. 1714.

⁵¹ 'Germany: Survey founds that one third of the grandchildren of Italian and Turkish immigrants does not have have German citizenship', *Globalcit*, 1 December 2014.

⁵² Hailbronner, K., 'Integration und Staatsangehörigkeit', in: Sieveking, K., *Wechselwirkungen von Migration und Integration im europäischen Mehrebenensystem,* Baden-Baden: Nomos 2001, pp. 89-96; Deinhard, M., *Das Recht der Staatsangehörigkeit unter dem Einfluss globaler Migrationserscheinungen*, Berlin: BWV Verlag 2015, p. 437 ff.; Dornis, C., 'Ungelöste Probleme des Staatsangehörigkeitsrechts: Gestufte Staatsangehörigkeit als Modell', *Zeitschrift für Rechtspolitik*, Vol. 12, 2001, pp. 547-549.

Latvia

Latvia has a long history of emigration, and outflows have accelerated after Latvia's accession to the European Union.⁵³ The question therefore arose how the country can remain connected to its diaspora; tolerating dual citizenship was considered to contribute to this goal.⁵⁴ Latvia nevertheless remained hesitant to accept dual citizenship in all cases, in particular in relation to other former Soviet states.⁵⁵ In 2013, an amending law was approved by the Latvian parliament which brought forward a compromise, entailing that Latvian citizenship can be retained if a citizen acquires the citizenship of an EU, EFTA or NATO Member State, Australia, Brazil, New Zealand, or a state with which Latvia has concluded a bilateral agreement (Art. 9 par. 1 Latvian Citizenship Act).⁵⁶ In addition to that, permission for retention of Latvian citizenship can be granted in exceptional cases on a discretionary basis. If citizenship of any other state is voluntarily acquired, there is an obligation to renounce Latvian citizenship within 30 days after acquiring another citizenship (Art. 23 par. 2 Latvian Citizenship Act). Otherwise, citizenship can still be revoked (Art. 24 par. 1 Latvian Citizenship Act). A similar provision was introduced for those who wish to acquire Latvian citizenship by ordinary naturalisation. If an applicant holds the citizenship of a state mentioned above or is a recognised refugee, there is no requirement to renounce the original citizenship (Art. 12 par. 2 Latvian Citizenship Act). For meritorious naturalisation, there is no renunciation requirement (Art. 13 Latvian Citizenship Act). An equally lenient regime is in place for Latvians and Livs⁵⁷ of origin who wish to acquire Latvian citizenship on the basis of their ancestry, as this group is exempted from the renunciation requirement regardless of their original citizenship (Art. 9 par. 3 Latvian Citizenship Act). This is also the case for Latvian exiles and their descendants that acquire Latvian citizenship by registration.⁵⁸ A person who acquired dual citizenship before reaching the age of majority (e.g. by birth) is in principle required to renounce any other citizenship before reaching the age of 25, unless he or she holds the citizenship of a country mentioned above or acquired citizenship by registration as a (descendant of a) Latvian exile (Art. 23 par. 3 Latvian Citizenship Act). If the other citizenship is not renounced, Latvian citizenship can be revoked (Art. 24 par. 1(1) Latvian Citizenship Act).

Lithuania

According to Art. 12 of the Lithuanian Constitution, a Lithuanian citizen is not permitted to be a citizen of both Lithuania and another state, except for "individual cases" provided for by law. As Lithuania is experiencing a population decline that is predominantly caused by emigration, there is increasing awareness for the fostering of diaspora relations and return migration.⁵⁹

⁵³ M. 'Hazans, Emigration from Latvia: A Brief History and Driving Forces in the Twenty-First Century', in: Kaša, R. and Mieriņa, I., *The Emigrant Communities of Latvia*, Springer 2019.

⁵⁴ https://www.mfa.gov.lv/en/policy/society-integration/citizenship/2013-amendments-to-the-citizenship-law-further-facilitation-of-citizenship, last accessed on 20 June 2020.

⁵⁵ Birka, I., Evaluation of Dual Citizenship Regulation of Latvia in Accordance with Theories of Democracy, University of Latvia Centre for Diaspora and Migration Research 2015, p. 6 ff.

^{56 357}L/11 Amendments to the Citizenship Act, Latvijas Republikas Saeimas Ziņotājs, No. 11, 13 June 2013, p. 52 ff

⁵⁷ The term 'Livs' refers to an indigenous group of Finno-Ugric descent living near the Baltic Sea. See: Krūma, K., *Country report on citizenship law: Latvia*, EUDO Citizenship Observatory, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute 2015, p. 6.

⁵⁸ A Latvian exile is defined as a person who proves that he or she left Latvia escaping from the U.S.S.R. or German occupation regime or has been deported between 17 June 1940 until 4 May 1990, and for that reason has not returned to Latvia for permanent residence until 4 May 1990 (Art. 8.¹ par. 1 Latvian Citizenship Act).

⁵⁹ Kūris, E., *Country report: Lithuania*, EUDO Citizenship Observatory, 2010, p. 32.

Therefore, there is political support for the toleration of dual citizenship.⁶⁰ A significant obstacle in this regard is a judgment of the Constitutional Court of Lithuania of 13 November 2003, which ruled that the general toleration of dual citizenship beyond individual and exceptional cases would violate Article 12 of the Lithuanian Constitution.⁶¹ In both 2008 and 2010, legislative proposals for general toleration of dual citizenship therefore were vetoed by the Lithuanian president on the ground that the proposals were not in line with the 2003 judgment of the Constitutional Court.⁶²

On 1 April 2011, a new Lithuanian Law on Citizenship came into force that in principle still retained a restrictive stance on dual citizenship. 63 Therefore, a Lithuanian citizen who acquires another citizenship will in principle automatically lose Lithuanian citizenship (Art. 26 par. 1 Lithuanian Law on Citizenship). Lithuanian citizens who acquired another citizenship before reaching the age of majority are required to renounce their other citizenship before reaching the age of 25 or will otherwise risk to be deprived of their Lithuanian citizenship (Art. 24 para. 8 Lithuania Law on Citizenship). Persons who wish to acquire Lithuanian citizenship by registration or by naturalisation are in principle required to renounce their original citizenship. However, the new law also provided a number of exemptions. 64 Despite the abovementioned Constitutional Court ruling, these exemptions were gradually expanded between 2015 and 2018.65 Most importantly, a 2015 amendment exempts persons who acquired more than one citizenship by birth from the requirement to renounce their other citizenship, meaning that a majority of dual citizens by birth is able to retain both citizenships (Art. 7 para. 1 Lithuanian Law on Citizenship). In addition to that, Lithuanian exiles and their descendants as well persons with "special merits" are allowed to become dual citizens (Art. 7 paras. 2-4 jo. 8-9 Lithuanian Law on Citizenship).

A constitutional referendum was held in 2019 on a proposal to amend Article 12 of the Lithuanian Constitution to more generally allow dual citizenship.⁶⁶ The referendum was prompted by the prospect of Brexit, as many of the approximately 200,000 Lithuanians residing in the United Kingdom were set to lose Lithuanian citizenship once they would acquire British citizenship.⁶⁷ Although a majority of 73% voted in approval of the proposal, the proposal was nevertheless not adopted as the majority that voted in approval represented only 34% of all eligible voters, whereas a minimum threshold of 50% was required for adopting a constitutional amendment.⁶⁸

The Netherlands

A 2010 amendment of the Netherlands Nationality Act constituted one of the rare cases that further restricted the approach towards dual citizenship. A requirement to renounce the original citizenship was introduced for two groups, namely persons who had resided in the Netherlands

⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 31.

⁶¹ Case No. 40/03, 45/03-36/04, Constitutional Court of the Republic of Lithuania, 30 December 2006. For an English summary of the judgment, see: https://www.lrkt.lt/en/court-acts/search/170/ta911/summary. ⁶² Kūris, E., op cit., p. 39 ff.

⁶³ Law on Citizenship of the Republic of Lithuania, XI-1196, Official Gazette [*Valstybės žinios*], No. 144-7561, 9 December 2010.

⁶⁴ Art. 7 Lithuanian Law on Citizenship 2010.

⁶⁵ Law XII-2050, Official Gazette, No. 18859, 27 November 2015; Law XII-2210, Official Gazette, No. 364, 6 January 2016; Law XI-1196, Official Gazette, No. 18828, 5 July 2016; Law XIII-1538, Official Gazette, No. 17327, 30 October 2018.

⁶⁶ 'Lithuanian referendum on dual citizenship: a divisive issue', *Globalcit*, 14 May 2019.

⁶⁷ H. Wright, 'Lithuanians to vote in referendum prompted by Brexit', *Politico*, 8 May 2019.

⁶⁸ 'Lithuania's citizenship referendum fails to attract required votes', *LRT*, 13 May 2019.

for a period of at least five years before attaining the age of majority and persons who were not born in the Netherlands, but who had resided in the country before attaining the age of four.⁶⁹ As the prevention of dual citizenship was considered to be an essential principle of Dutch citizenship, it was argued that the renunciation requirement had to be extended to these groups as well.⁷⁰

In 2017, a new coalition government entered into office and presented a coalition agreement that proposed a number of changes regarding dual citizenship.⁷¹ The abovementioned loss provisions would be revoked in order to allow first generation immigrants and emigrants to hold more than one citizenship. However, a new loss provision would be introduced in order to require second generation immigrants and emigrations upon reaching a particular age to opt for one of their citizenships.⁷² At the moment of writing, the government has not yet drafted a proposal in order to amend the relevant provisions in the Dutch Citizenship Act accordingly. In 2018, in response to parliamentary questions on the matter, it was stated that the preparation of a bill would take longer due to the complexity of the matter.⁷³

In January 2019, the looming prospect of Brexit prompted parliamentarians to submit a bill in order to temporarily allow dual citizenship for Dutch citizens who wished to acquire British citizenship as well as for British citizens who wished to acquire Dutch citizenship, although the provisions for British citizens were later removed from the bill.⁷⁴ The bill was approved by a majority in the Second Chamber on 5 November 2019.⁷⁵ After that, the process stalled in the Senate as the introduction of the emergency bill was considered to be premature due to approval of the EU-UK Withdrawal Agreement and the avoidance of a 'hard Brexit'. The bill was eventually approved by the Senate, but it will enter into force at a date to be determined later, and only if the rights of Dutch citizens in the United Kingdom are deemed to be insufficiently guaranteed.⁷⁶

Slovakia

Until 2010, Slovakian citizenship law had a tolerant attitude towards dual citizenship, as a Slovak national would not lose her citizenship upon the acquisition of another citizenship, while a foreign national who wished to obtain Slovak citizenship was not required to renounce her original citizenship.⁷⁷ This changed when Hungary introduced a provision for the facilitated acquisition of citizenship for ethnic Hungarians residing abroad, who were able to acquire Hungarian citizenship as long as they had knowledge of the Hungarian language, a clear criminal record and did not constitute a threat to public order.⁷⁸

⁶⁹ Kingdom Act of 17 June 2010, Amendment of the Kingdom Act on Dutch Nationality in relation to multiple nationality and other issues related to nationality law, Official Gazette [*Staatsblad*], No. 210, 2010.

⁷⁰ Explanatory Memorandum, Amendment of the Kingdom Act on Dutch Nationality in relation to multiple nationality and other issues related to nationality law, Parliamentary Document 31813, 22 December 2008, p. 1.

⁷¹ Annex 820240, Parliamentary Document 34700, No. 34, 10 November 2017.

⁷² Ibid, p. 6.

⁷³ Parliamentary question No. 3105, Second Chamber of Parliament, 6 September 2018.

⁷⁴ Parliamentary Document 35130, Second Chamber of Parliament, 29 January 2019.

⁷⁵ Voting results on Parliamentary Document 35130, Second Chamber of Parliament, 5 November 2019.

⁷⁶ Voting results on Parliamentary Document 35130, First Chamber of Parliament, 30 June 2020.

⁷⁷ See for an historical overview of Slovak citizenship law: Kusá, D., *Country report: Slovakia*, EUDO Citizenship Observatory, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute 2013.

⁷⁸ Art. 4 par. 3 Act LV of 1993 on Hungarian Citizenship. See also: Tóth, J., "Update: Changes in the Hungarian citizenship law and adopted on 26 May 2010", EUDO Citizenship Observatory, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute 2010; Pogonyi, S., "Dual citizenship and sovereignty", *Nationalities Papers*, 2011,

The Hungarian amendment was perceived by Slovakia as a threat to the country's autonomy. Therefore, Slovakia introduced a loss provision in its citizenship law, meaning that the acquisition of a foreign citizenship would now automatically lead to the loss of Slovak citizenship. A Slovak national who acquired another citizenship was obliged to report this or, failing to do so, could be subjected to a fine. In 2011, a case was filed at the Slovak Constitutional Court, arguing that the loss provision violated Art. 5 of the Slovak Constitution, which stipulated that no one can be deprived of their Slovak citizenship against their will. In 2014, the Slovak Constitutional Court approved the amendments of the citizenship law on formal grounds, without a substantive assessment of the case.

In 2015, a provision came into force that slightly mitigated the effect of the amendment. A share of the persons who had lost Slovak citizenship were enabled to reacquire it on a discretionary basis if they had 'special reasons' for the reacquisition of Slovak citizenship.⁸³ This required proof of either special contributions to Slovak society (e.g. in the fields of science or sports) or that the reacquisition of citizenship was otherwise in the interest of the Slovak Republic, or, alternatively, humanitarian reasons.⁸⁴

Spain

In 2015, Spain introduced a preferential pathway to Spanish citizenship for persons of Sephardic Jewish origin, emulating a Portuguese law of 2013 that also provides for citizenship for Sephardic Jews. Sephardic Jews were banished from the Iberian Peninsula through the Alhambra Decree and subsequently dispersed across Europe, the Ottoman Empire and the Maghreb. In order to recognize the sufferings of the Sephardic Jews, Spain offered the distant descendants of the expelled Sephardic Jews the option to acquire Spanish citizenship under facilitated conditions. First of all, persons of Sephardic Jewish origin were exempted from the requirement to renounce their original citizenship upon acquisition of Spanish citizenship by an amendment of Art. 23 of the Civil Code. Thereby, persons of Sephardic Jewish origin were treated on equal footing with citizens of Ibero-American countries, Andorra, Portugal Equatorial Guinea or the Philippines who have long enjoyed a privileged position in

Vol. 39 No. 5, pp. 685-704; Waterbury, M., *Between state and nation: Diaspora politics and kin-state nationalism in Hungary*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

⁷⁹ Jenne, E. and Deets, S., "Political Context Matters. The Banality of Hungary's Dual Citizenship Law and Slovakia's Response", in: Bauböck, R. (ed.), "Dual citizenship for transborder minorities? How to respond to the Hungarian-Slovak tit-for-tat", EUDO Citizenship Observatory, San Domenico di Fiesole: European University Institute 2010.

⁸⁰ Act No. 250/2010 Amending and Supplementing the Act No. 40/1993 on state Citizenship of the Slovak Republic, Collection of Laws of the Slovak Republic [*Zbierka zákonov Slovenskej republiky*], 250/2010, 4 June 2010

⁸¹ Art. 9 par. 16 Act No. 40/1993 on Citizenship of the Slovak Republic.

⁸² Judgment ÚS 11/2012-137, Constitutional Court of the Slovak Republic, 17 September 2014. See also: Kusa, D., 'Is the Slovak Citizenship Act unconstitutional? The Constitutional Court leaves the question open', *Globalcit*, 29 September 2014.

⁸³ Regulation of the Ministry of the Interior of the Slovak Republic of 9 January 2015 on the grant of nationality of the Slovak Republic for special reasons, Gazette [*Vestnik*], No. 1, 9 January 2015.

⁸⁴ Ibid., Art. 1.

⁸⁵ For the Portuguese Act, see: Organic Law 1/2013, Portuguese Official Journal Series [*Diário da República*], No. 144, 29 July 2013.

⁸⁶ Ullman, J.C., "A survey course in the history of the Jews in Spain: from antiquity to the present", in: Gerber, J. S., *Jews of Spain: A History of the Sephardic Experience*, New York: Simon and Schuster, 1994, p. 140; Lachenicht, S., "Sephardi Jews: Cosmopolitans in the Atlantic World", in: Lachenicht, S. and Heinsohn, K. (eds.), *Diaspora Identities: Exile, Nationalism and Cosmopolitanism in Past and Present*, Frankfurt: Campus Verlag, 2009, p. 31-52.

⁸⁷ Law 12/2015, Official state Gazette [Boletín Oficial del Estado], No. 151, 25 June 2015.

Spanish citizenship law.⁸⁸ In addition to these permanent changes, persons of Sephardic origin were temporarily enabled to acquire Spanish citizenship through special naturalisation (*carta de naturaleza*) if they could submit proof of their Sephardic origin as well as their 'special relationship' with Spain.⁸⁹ In 2018, the initial three-year deadline for submitting applications was extended with one additional year, which meant that the special provisions were in force until October 2019.⁹⁰

4. Conclusions

This report has studied the developments in the EU-28 for three types of dual citizenship restrictions in the period 2010-2020, namely 1) requirements to renounce the original citizenship upon the acquisition of citizenship (Globalcit modes of acquisition A05-A27), 2) provisions stipulating the (automatic or not-automatic) loss of citizenship upon the acquisition of a foreign citizenship (Globalcit mode of loss L05), and 3) provisions stipulating the (automatic or non-automatic) loss of citizenship upon the retention of a foreign citizenship (Globalcit mode of loss L06).

The report has shown that, on 1 January 2020, in 16 EU Member States (Belgium, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, France, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Luxembourg, Malta, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Sweden and the United Kingdom), none of the three dual citizenship restrictions mentioned above were in place, while 12 other EU Member States (Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Estonia, Germany, Ireland, Latvia, Lithuania, the Netherlands, Slovakia, Slovenia and Spain) did impose at least one of these three restrictions.

In ten EU Member States (Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Estonia, Germany, Latvia, Lithuania, the Netherlands, Slovenia and Spain), the renunciation of an original citizenship is required upon the acquisition of citizenship. However, this requirement is not absolute in any of these states. Exemptions are common for spouses, recognised refugees, citizens of particular origin countries or persons who are culturally affiliated to the country and persons who acquire citizenship on meritorious or economic grounds.

In nine EU Member States (Austria, Estonia, Germany, Ireland, Latvia, Lithuania, the Netherlands, Slovakia and Spain), the acquisition of a foreign citizenship can result in the loss of citizenship. Only in Slovakia, this provision is absolute. The other eight states provide exceptions to their main rule. These exceptions are most extensive in Estonia and Ireland, as Estonian citizens by birth are constitutionally protected from involuntary loss of citizenship, while the Irish loss provision is only applicable to citizens by naturalisation. For the other states, the most common exemptions are related to citizens who acquire the citizenship of particular states or enable citizens to obtain permission for retention of citizenship.

Provisions for the loss of citizenship upon the retention of a foreign citizenship acquired during minority are relatively rare, as only three states (Germany, Latvia and Lithuania) have implemented such a rule. In Lithuania, the scope of the provision is very small, as Lithuanian citizens by birth are exempted. Germany and Latvia also provide for numerous exemptions, as Germany *inter alia* exempts those who established sufficient ties with Germany during minority as well as citizens of EU Member States and Switzerland, while Latvia exempts citizens of EU,

⁸⁸ Vonk, O., *Dual nationality in the European Union : a study on changing norms in public and private international law and in the municipal laws of four EU Member States*, Leiden: Brill Publishers 2012, p. 281 ff. ⁸⁹ Art. 1 par. 1 Law 12/2015.

⁹⁰ Ordinance, PRA/325/2018, Official state Gazette [Boletin Oficial del Estado], No. 75, 15 March 2018.

EEA- and NATO Member States, as well as Australia, Brazil and New Zealand, in addition to a range of smaller exemptions.

Another finding is that dual citizenship is restricted asymmetrically in five EU Member States. In Bulgaria, Croatia and Slovenia, dual citizenship is restricted for foreign citizens who acquire citizenship, but not for citizens who acquire a foreign citizenship. Conversely, in Ireland (for citizens by naturalisation) and Slovakia, dual citizenship is restricted for persons who acquire a foreign citizenship, but not for foreign citizens who acquire citizenship.

Dual citizenship can only occur if two states concurrently permit dual citizenship. Therefore, this report has also studied provisions requiring the renunciation of the original citizenship for acquisition of citizenship and provisions imposing the loss of original citizenship upon acquisition of a foreign citizenship in cohesion, or as 'citizenship constellations'. In total, this approach results in 756 possible citizenship constellations. Of these 756 constellations, 461 constellations (61%) do not restrict dual citizenship in any case. The 756 constellations covered the acquisition of citizenship of 153,317 persons for the reference year of 2018. Of these 153,317 persons, 141,669 persons (92.4%) were covered by a non-restrictive citizenship constellation, meaning that dual citizenship was not restricted in any case. It is likely that a share of the persons covered by a potentially restrictive constellation in the EU-28 (11,648 persons out of 153,317 persons, or 11.6%) was still able to retain the original citizenship. As stated earlier, many important exceptions to the restrictive provisions could not be taken into account in this analysis.

It is also clear that Brexit had a substantial impact on intra-EU citizenship acquisitions, as 47,584 EU citizens acquired British citizenship in 2018, while 16,193 British citizens acquired another EU citizenship in the same year, which covers more than one third of all EU citizens who acquired another EU citizenship. Out of the 47,584 EU citizens who acquired British citizenship, 46,228 (97.2%) was covered by a permissive citizenship constellation. Out of 16,193 British citizens who acquired another EU citizenship, 14,835 persons (91.6%) were covered by such a permissive constellation. However, the overrepresentation of persons covered by a permissive citizenship constellation could also indicate that restrictions on dual citizenship impede persons from acquiring another EU citizenship. This possibility can be further assessed on the basis of the naturalisation rate. An analysis of the naturalisation rates of citizens of EU Member States in the United Kingdom as well as British citizens in EU Member States indeed indicates that naturalisation rates are far lower for restrictive constellations than for permissive constellations.

Between 1 January 2010 and 1 January 2020, nine EU Member States (Austria, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Denmark, Germany, Latvia, the Netherlands, Slovakia and Spain) enacted changes in their citizenship legislation related to dual citizenship. In all except two countries (the Netherlands and Slovakia), these changes embodied a further tolerance of dual citizenship. Two countries (Czech Republic and Denmark) abolished dual citizenship restrictions altogether, while the remaining countries introduced new exception grounds to their dual citizenship restrictions. In certain cases, these changes introduced broad exception grounds, such as exceptions regarding citizens of particular states (Bulgaria and Latvia) or spouses of citizens (Bulgaria), or exceptions regarding the 'option duty' for those who established sufficient ties with the country during minority (Germany). In other countries, changes were smaller in scope, such as the introduction or the broadening of a distinct route to citizenship without a requirement to renounce the original citizenship for the victims of National Socialism (Austria), the descendants of Sephardic Jews (Spain) or investors (Bulgaria). These developments again underline the increasing tolerance of dual citizenship. The further proliferation of grounds for exemption from dual citizenship restrictions shows that restrictive states increasingly mitigate their resistance to dual citizenship, but also that dual citizenship is in certain cases regarded as a privileged status that remains reserved for a subgroup of citizens.

Although this report has conclusively shown that the tolerance of dual citizenship has become the norm in EU Member States, other research avenues remain open to explore. A brief study of naturalisation rates among EU citizens in the United Kingdom and British citizens in EU Member States indicates that dual citizenship restrictions deter persons from obtaining another citizenship, although other mitigating or exacerbating factors could also play a role in this regard, which therefore requires further scholarly attention. Next to that, the interactions between national citizenship and EU citizenship could be explored further. Over the past decades, EU citizenship has developed into a fundamental status, granting a 'bundle of rights' across all EU Member States. Yet, as indicated above, a substantial number of EU citizens still go to the process of acquiring another EU Member State citizenship, even if Brexit-related cases are ignored. Therefore, the precise discrepancies between EU citizenship status and national (EU Member State) citizenship status could be a subject of further study.

Table 1 – Overview of dual citizenship policies in the EU-28

		Austria	Belgium	Bulgaria	Croatia	Cyprus
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship		No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship			No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship
A05	Birth in country (acquisition after birth)	Renunciation - exceptions		Renunciation - exceptions	Renunciation	
A06	Ordinary naturalisation	Renunciation (note: exceptions A22/ A24/A26/A27)		Renunciation (note: exceptions A08/ A19/A22/A24/A26)	Renunciation (note: exceptions A08/ A19/A24)	
A07	Socialisation-based acquisition	n.a.		n.a.	n.a.	
A08	Spousal transfer	Renunciation		No renunciation	No renunciation	
A09	Filial transfer	n.a.		n.a.	n.a.	
A10	Adoption	No renunciation		No renunciation	No renunciation	
A11	Transfer to other relatives	n.a.		n.a.	n.a.	
A12	Transfer from former citizen	No renunciation		No renunciation	n.a.	
A13	Spousal extension	Renunciation - exceptions		n.a.	Renunciation - exceptions	
A14	Filial extension	Renunciation - exceptions		No renunciation	No renunciation	
A15	Extension to other relatives	n.a.		n.a.	n.a.	
A16	Reacquisition	Renunciation - exceptions		No renunciation	No renunciation	
A17	Restricted citizenship rights	n.a.		n.a.	n.a.	
A18	Citizenship of a specific country	Renunciation - exceptions		n.a.	n.a.	
A19	Cultural affinity	n.a.		No renunciation	No renunciation	
A20	Presumed citizens	No renunciation		n.a.	n.a.	
A21	Very long residence	Renunciation - exceptions		n.a.	n.a.	
A22	Refugees	No renunciation		No renunciation	n.a.	
A23	stateless or unclear citizenship	No renunciation		No renunciation	n.a.	
A24	Special achievements	No renunciation		No renunciation	No renunciation	
A25	Public service	n.a.		n.a.	n.a.	
A26	Financial assets	No renunciation		No renunciation	n.a.	
A27	Other reasons	No renunciation		n.a.	n.a.	
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship		No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship
L05	Acquisition of foreign citizenship	Loss - exceptions				
L06	Non-renunciation foreign citizenship (acquisition by birth)	n.a.				

Luuk van der Baaren

		Czech Republic	Denmark	Estonia	Finland	France
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship	No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship	No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship		No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship	No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship
A05	Birth in country (acquisition after birth)			n.a.		
A06	Ordinary naturalisation			Renunciation (note: exception A24 + exception for citizens by birth)		
A07	Socialisation-based acquisition			n.a.		
A08	Spousal transfer			n.a.		
A09	Filial transfer			No renunciation		
A10	Adoption			Renunciation		
A11	Transfer to other relatives			n.a.		
A12	Transfer from former citizen			n.a.		
A13	Spousal extension			n.a.		
A14	Filial extension			Renunciation		
A15	Extension to other relatives			n.a.		
A16	Reacquisition			Renunciation		
A17	Restricted citizenship rights			n.a.		
A18	Citizenship of a specific country			n.a.		
A19	Cultural affinity			n.a.		
A20	Presumed citizens			No renunciation		
A21	Very long residence			n.a.		
A22	Refugees			n.a.		
A23	stateless or unclear citizenship			n.a.		
A24	Special achievements			No renunciation		
A25	Public service			n.a.		
A26	Financial assets			n.a.		
A27	Other reasons			n.a.		
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship		No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship
L05	Acquisition of foreign citizenship			Loss - if citizen other than by birth		
L06	Non-renunciation foreign citizenship (acquisition by birth)			n.a.		

		Germany	Greece	Hungary	Ireland	Italy
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship		No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship			
A05	Birth in country (acquisition after birth)	n.a.				
A06	Ordinary naturalisation	Renunciation (note: exceptions A18/ A22 + exception if permission)				
A07	Socialisation-based acquisition	n.a.				
80A	Spousal transfer	Renunciation - exceptions				
A09	Filial transfer					
A10	Adoption	No renunciation				
A11	Transfer to other relatives					
A12	Transfer from former citizen	Renunciation - exceptions				
A13	Spousal extension	Renunciation - exceptions				
A14	Filial extension	Renunciation - exceptions				
A15	Extension to other relatives					
A16	Reacquisition	Renunciation - exceptions				
A17	Restricted citizenship rights	n.a.				
A18	Citizenship of a specific country	No renunciation				
A19	Cultural affinity	Renunciation - exceptions				
A20	Presumed citizens	No renunciation				
A21	Very long residence	n.a.				
A22	Refugees	No renunciation				
A23	stateless or unclear citizenship	No renunciation				
A24	Special achievements	Renunciation - exceptions				
A25	Public service	Renunciation - exceptions				
A26	Financial assets	n.a.				
A27	Other reasons	Renunciation - exceptions				
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship		No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship		No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship
L05	Acquisition of foreign citizenship	Loss - exceptions			Loss - if citizen by naturalisation	
L06	Non-renunciation foreign citizenship (acquisition by birth)	Loss - exceptions			n.a.	

Luuk van der Baaren

		Latvia	Lithuania	Luxembourg	Malta	Netherlands
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship			No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship	No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship	
A05	Birth in country (acquisition after birth)	n.a.	n.a.			No renunciation
A06	Ordinary naturalisation	Renunciation (note: exceptions A18/ A24/A27)	Renunciation (note: exceptions A22/ A24)			Renunciation (note: exceptions A05/ A08/A22)
A07	Socialisation-based acquisition	n.a.	n.a.			Renunciation - exceptions
A08	Spousal transfer	n.a.	Renunciation			No renunciation
A09	Filial transfer	n.a.	n.a.			No renunciation
A10	Adoption	n.a.	No renunciation			No renunciation
A11	Transfer to other relatives	n.a.	n.a.			n.a.
A12	Transfer from former citizen	n.a.	No renunciation			n.a.
A13	Spousal extension	n.a.	n.a.			n.a.
A14	Filial extension	Renunciation - exceptions	No renunciation			No renunciation
A15	Extension to other relatives	n.a.	n.a.			n.a.
A16	Reacquisition	Renunciation - exceptions	Renunciation - exceptions			Renunciation - exceptions
A17	Restricted citizenship rights	n.a.	n.a.			n.a.
A18	Citizenship of a specific country	No renunciation	n.a.			n.a.
A19	Cultural affinity	n.a.	Renunciation - exceptions			n.a.
A20	Presumed citizens	n.a.	n.a.			n.a.
A21	Very long residence	n.a.	n.a.			No renunciation
A22	Refugees	n.a.	No renunciation			No renunciation
A23	stateless or unclear citizenship	n.a.	n.a.			No renunciation
A24	Special achievements	No renunciation	No renunciation			Renunciation - exceptions
A25	Public service	n.a.	n.a.			n.a.
A26	Financial assets	n.a.	n.a.			n.a.
A27	Other reasons	No renunciation	n.a.			Renunciation - exceptions
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship			No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	
L05	Acquisition of foreign citizenship	Loss - exceptions	Loss - exceptions			Loss - exceptions
L06	Non-renunciation foreign citizenship (acquisition by birth)	Loss - exceptions	Loss (exception for citizens by birth)			n.a.

		Poland	Portugal	Romania	Slovakia	Slovenia
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship	No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship				
A05	Birth in country (acquisition after birth)					No renunciation
A06	Ordinary naturalisation					Renunciation (note: exceptions A22/ A24/A26)
A07	Socialisation-based acquisition					Renunciation
80A	Spousal transfer					Renunciation
A09	Filial transfer					n.a.
A10	Adoption					No renunciation
A11	Transfer to other relatives					n.a.
A12	Transfer from former citizen					No renunciation
A13	Spousal extension					n.a.
A14	Filial extension					No renunciation
A15	Extension to other relatives					n.a.
A16	Reacquisition					n.a.
A17	Restricted citizenship rights					n.a.
A18	Citizenship of a specific country					n.a.
A19	Cultural affinity					n.a.
A20	Presumed citizens					n.a.
A21	Very long residence					n.a.
A22	Refugees					No renunciation
A23	stateless or unclear citizenship					No renunciation
A24	Special achievements					No renunciation
A25	Public service					n.a.
A26	Financial assets					No renunciation
A27	Other reasons					n.a.
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship	No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship		No loss of citizenship upon ret/acq foreign citizenship
L05	Acquisition of foreign citizenship				Loss	
L06	Non-renunciation foreign citizenship (acquisition by birth)				n.a.	

Luuk van der Baaren

		Spain	Sweden	United Kingdom
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship		No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship	No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship
A05	Birth in country (acquisition after birth)	Renunciation		
A06	Ordinary naturalisation	Renunciation (note: exceptions A08/ A19/A22/A27)		
A07	Socialisation-based acquisition	n.a.		
A08	Spousal transfer	No renunciation		
A09	Filial transfer	Renunciation - exceptions		
A10	Adoption	Renunciation - exceptions		
A11	Transfer to other relatives	n.a.		
A12	Transfer from former citizen	Renunciation - exceptions		
A13	Spousal extension	n.a.		
A14	Filial extension	n.a.		
A15	Extension to other relatives	n.a.		
A16	Reacquisition	No renunciation		
A17	Restricted citizenship rights	n.a.		
A18	Citizenship of a specific country	No renunciation		
A19	Cultural affinity	No renunciation		
A20	Presumed citizens	No renunciation		
A21	Very long residence	n.a.		
A22	Refugees	No renunciation		
A23	stateless or unclear citizenship	n.a.		
A24	Special achievements	n.a.		
A25	Public service	n.a.		
A26	Financial assets	n.a.		
A27	Other reasons	No renunciation		
	Renunciation requirement for acquisition of citizenship		No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship	No renunciation required for any mode of acquisition of citizenship
L05	Acquisition of foreign citizenship	Loss - exceptions + prevention of loss by declaration		
L06	Non-renunciation foreign citizenship (acquisition by birth)	n.a.		

Table 2 – Citizenship constellations in the EU-28⁹¹

Cells that are marked grey are wholly permissive constellations. Cells that are unmarked are (partially) non-permissive constellations. Cell depicts number of citizens of country in row header who acquired citizenship in country of column header.

country of cor			Country w	here citizenship	is acquired		
Original citizenship	Austria	Belgium	Bulgaria	Croatia	Cyprus	Czechia	Denmark
Austria		9	0	8	1	2	7
Belgium	9		0	0	1	1	4
Bulgaria	147	554		3	113	25	21
Croatia	251	16	0		1	22	4
Cyprus	0	3	0	0		0	0
Czechia	66	36	1	1	2		9
Denmark	0	18	0	0	1	0	
Estonia ⁹²	5	12	0	0	1	1	11
Finland	0	10	0	0	0	0	35
France	3	869	0	0	5	0	41
Germany	265	244	2	15	6	8	168
Greece	7	200	4	1	369	3	7
Hungary	258	112	0	2	1	2	16
Ireland ⁹³	0	28	1	0	2	0	12
Italy	50	1.352	1	3	2	3	30
Latvia	2	45	0	0	11	1	20
Lithuania	11	26	0	0	5	1	21
Luxembourg	0	21	0	0	0	0	0
Malta	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
Netherlands	13	1.064	0	0	2	1	20
Poland	150	1.528	5	4	13	45	122
Portugal	3	272	0	0	1	0	11
Romania	456	2.219	0	8	103	51	49
Slovakia	197	60	0	2	5	346	9
Slovenia	54	12	0	16	0	1	2
Spain ⁹⁴	4	706	0	0	0	0	23
Sweden	2	14	0	3	4	3	185
UK	40	1.045	0	2	658	27	143

⁹¹ Data for Romania is unavailable. Source: European Commission, "Acquisition of citizenship (2018)" [data file], Eurostat, 2020, via <eurostat.ec.europa.eu>.

⁹² Estonian citizens by birth can retain citizenship upon acquisition of a foreign citizenship (see Section 3).

⁹³ Only citizens by naturalisation can be deprived of citizenship upon acquisition of a foreign citizenship (see section 3).

⁹⁴ Loss of Spanish citizenship upon acquisition of a foreign citizenship can be prevented by making a declaration.

	Estonia	Finland	France	Germany	Greece	Hungary	Ireland
Austria	0	2	10	390	2	7	3
Belgium	0	9	422	150	5	1	4
Bulgaria	1	55	340	1.855	220	29	58
Croatia	0	6	37	2.360	2	17	14
Cyprus	0	1	10	25	38	1	0
Czechia	0	6	44	580	6	6	28
Denmark	0	7	44	105	0	0	2
Estonia		541	4	85	0	0	23
Finland	0		22	110	3	1	2
France	0	10		830	20	5	28
Germany	0	45	502		17	50	42
Greece	0	21	151	3.230		7	13
Hungary	1	62	162	1.115	8		142
Ireland	0	5	65	70	0	1	
Italy	0	22	1.006	4.050	19	8	44
Latvia	7	30	19	325	0	1	308
Lithuania	1	23	22	400	9	0	133
Luxembourg	0	0	9	40	0	0	0
Malta	0	1	9	5	0	0	0
Netherlands	0	3	126	715	5	2	6
Poland	0	72	889	6.245	78	19	1.464
Portugal	0	0	2.080	745	2	0	18
Romania	1	75	1.956	4.345	291	2.123	819
Slovakia	0	9	93	345	3	223	33
Slovenia	0	1	7	215	0	9	2
Spain	0	38	568	1.145	1	0	37
Sweden	0	210	37	125	2	2	3
United Kingdom	1	134	3.268	6.250	52	22	687

	Italy	Latvia	Lithuania	Luxembourg	Malta	Netherlands	Poland
Austria	9	1	0	2	0	14	3
Belgium	28	0	0	413	3	167	1
Bulgaria	491	7	0	26	13	128	12
Croatia	224	1	0	16	1	44	3
Cyprus	1	2	0	1	1	0	0
Czechia	46	0	0	11	8	33	10
Denmark	5	0	0	69	1	23	7
Estonia	4	3	0	4	1	9	0
Finland	2	1	0	21	4	12	0
France	110	5	0	760	5	74	7
Germany	91	23	1	286	27	307	66
Greece	45	2	0	99	5	115	5
Hungary	159	2	0	23	5	87	8
Ireland	2	20	0	30	4	25	0
Italy		10	0	440	74	181	10
Latvia	29		0	4	2	26	4
Lithuania	30	14		3	4	37	12
Luxembourg							
	1	0	0		0	2	0
Malta	3	2	0	6		5	0
Netherlands	12	4	0	56	8		3
Poland	833	5	0	94	16	361	<u> </u>
Portugal	21	0	0	1.591	0	62	2
Romania	6.542	0	0	54	21	173	23
Slovakia	52	1	0	6	4	26	3
Slovenia	19	0	0	6	0	6	1
Spain	44	7	0	122	4	119	3
Sweden	11	4	0	31	6	25	22
United Kingdom	231	97	0	399	295	1.258	27

	Portugal	Romania	Slovakia	Slovenia	Spain	Sweden	United Kingdom
Austria	1	n/a	1	1	0	37	153
Belgium	9	n/a	1	1	19	46	440
Bulgaria	67	n/a	12	3	338	273	2.640
Croatia	2	n/a	1	40	7	138	68
Cyprus	0	n/a	0	0	0	8	309
Czechia	1	n/a	119	3	11	63	706
Denmark	1	n/a	4	0	0	2.053	446
Estonia	0	n/a	0	0	5	147	183
Finland	1	n/a	0	0	1	2.521	273
France	30	n/a	4	0	94	200	4.106
Germany	27	n/a	41	3	46	893	4.759
Greece	0	n/a	0	0	11	377	1.761
Hungary	8	n/a	15	1	9	363	2.133
Ireland	1	n/a	1	0	4	69	598
Italy	27	n/a	4	13	398	319	5.255
Latvia	7	n/a	1	1	13	209	1.275
Lithuania	1	n/a	1	0	15	213	712
Luxembourg	0	n/a	5	0	0	3	21
Malta	2	n/a	0	0	0	3	153
Netherlands	4	n/a	2	0	8	201	904
Poland	26	n/a	9	2	144	1.783	9.626
Portugal	0	n/a	0	0	296	76	1.906
Romania	434	n/a	25	3	991	779	5.527
Slovakia	2	n/a	0	2	15	32	491
Slovenia	0	n/a	0	0	1	26	94
Spain	37	n/a	0	2	0	249	2.401
Sweden	1	n/a	1	1	5	0	644
United Kingdom	100	n/a	60	1	56	1.340	0

Table 3 – Naturalisation rate for citizens of EU MS in UK and citizens of UK in EU MS (2018)⁹⁵

Cells that are marked grey are wholly permissive constellations. Cells that are unmarked are (partially) non-permissive constellations

	Citizens of other EU MS acquiring British citizenship		British citizens acquiring citizenship of other EU MS
Nationality of origin	Naturalisation rate	Receiving country	Naturalisation rate
Austria	0.82%	Austria	0.37%
Belgium	1.75%	Belgium	4.92%
Bulgaria	3.02%	Bulgaria	0.00%
Croatia	1.17%	Croatia	0.28%
Cyprus	1.62%	Cyprus	n/a
Czechia	1.43%	Czechia	0.40%
Denmark	1.39%	Denmark	0.78%
Estonia ⁹⁶	1.76%	Estonia	0.14%
Finland	1.65%	Finland	2.97%
France	2.24%	France	2.27%
Germany	3.05%	Germany	6.73%
Greece	2.50%	Greece	0.32%
Hungary	2.14%	Hungary	0.69%
Ireland ⁹⁷	0.17%	Ireland	0.63%
Italy	1.75%	Italy	0.82%
Latvia	1.08%	Latvia	34.28%
Lithuania	0.35%	Lithuania	0.00%
Luxembourg	3.11%	Luxembourg	6.72%
Malta	1.77%	Malta	n/a
Netherlands	0.92%	Netherlands	2.73%
Poland	0.93%	Poland	1.12%
Portugal	0.80%	Portugal	0.45%
Romania	1.33%	Romania	n/a
Slovakia	0.59%	Slovakia	2.99%
Slovenia	1.77%	Slovenia	0.19%
Spain ⁹⁸	1.30%	Spain	0.02%
Sweden	1.50%	Sweden	6.71%
United Kingdom		United Kingdom	
Overall	1.23%	Overall	1.80%
Overall - perm con	1.31%	Overall - perm con	2.77%
Overall - non-perm	0.56%	Overall - non-perm	0.16%

⁹⁵ Population data for Cyprus, Malta and Romania not available. See Table 1 for country notes. Data source: European Commission, "Acquisition of citizenship (2018)" [data file], Eurostat, 2020, via <eurostat.ec.europa.eu>; European Commission, "EU/EFTA population who usually resides in another EU/EFTA country (2018)" [data file], Eurostat, 2020, via <eurostat.ec.europa.eu>.

⁹⁶ Estonian citizens by birth can retain citizenship upon acquisition of a foreign citizenship (see Section 3).

⁹⁷ Only citizens by naturalisation can be deprived of citizenship upon acquisition of a foreign citizenship (see section 3).

⁹⁸ Loss of Spanish citizenship upon acquisition of a foreign citizenship can be prevented by making a declaration.

